

# **DIOCESE OF ERIE**



# Reverend Michael J. Amy

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH: 1952  
YEAR OF DEATH: N/A  
ORDINATION: August 11, 1978

## Employment/Assignment History

6/23/1978 – 7/05/1979 Asst. Pastor, Our Lady of Peace, Erie, PA  
7/05/1979 – 8/28/1981 Faculty, Cathedral Preparatory. Residence at Blessed Sacrament, Erie, PA  
8/28/1981 – 6/14/1985 Faculty, Cathedral Preparatory, Residence at Holy Trinity Rectory, Erie, PA  
4/23/1983 Chaplin, Catholic Scouting Committee  
6/14/1985 – 1/20/1986 Faculty, Elk Co. Christian, Residing at Holy Rosary Johnsonburg PA. Weekend Asst. St. Callistus, Kane, PA  
1/20/1986 Weekend Asst. Holy Rosary, Johnsonburg, PA  
6/14/1985 – 6/17/1988 Faculty, Elk Co. Catholic. Residing at Holy Rosary, St. Mary's, PA  
6/17/1988 – 1/31/1990 Faculty, Bradford Central Christian HS. Residing at St. Bernard, Bradford, PA  
4/19/1989 – 12/15/1989 Administration, St. Callistus, Kane, PA Residing at St. Callistus Rectory, Kane, PA  
12/15/1989 – 12/22/1991 Pastor, St. Callistus. Residing at St. Callistus Rectory, Kane, PA  
12/22/1991 – 2/05/1992 Sick leave  
1/05/1992 – 3/01/1993 Sick leave  
11/1993 Living in private residence

## Summary

Between 1974 and 1975, Father Michael Amy - - a Seminarian at the time - - worked as a camp counselor at Camp Notre Dame in Fairview. In an October 25, 1993 letter to the Diocese of ██████████, Amy wrote:

*I took the opportunity to touch the genitals of several boys at night. Two, at least were aware of my fondling. In 1974 one of them ran away because of my molesting him. The PA State Police were involved in the search. When he was found, he spoke of the molesting.*

Amy went on to describe how he was initially taken into custody by the State Police but was not arrested, nor were charges ever brought against him.

## Summary

Amy was ordained on August 11, 1978, and served in over eight parishes over the course of the next 14 years. He later admitted that while serving as a priest he was involved with male prostitutes in the Erie area, as well as in Pittsburgh and Baltimore. Many of these male prostitutes were minors.

In December 1991, a male contacted the Diocese to report that he met Amy in the early 1980s when he was 14-years-old. He and Amy met in Erie on West 18<sup>th</sup> street, which was an area known for prostitution at that time. The male reported that he was an underage prostitute dealing with substance abuse issues at that time. Amy gave him money and, in exchange, they would engage in sexual contact, sometimes at the rectory of Holy Trinity Church. Bishop Trautman sent Amy to St. Luke's Institute for psychiatric treatment following this report.

In 1993, the Diocese acted to remove Amy. At the laicization proceeding, Father Sal Luzzi and Father Leon Muroski, who were spiritual counselors to Amy and other seminarians were asked to fill out a questionnaire about Amy. Additionally, Father Lawrence T. Speice, a member of the Board of Directors at Camp Notre Dame in the 1970's, was asked to complete a questionnaire. The questionnaire asked nineteen questions about the depth of the relationship they had with Amy, as well as Amy's background, work ethic, and moral character.

One question asked, *"Has his conduct as a priest ever been a source of scandal or wonderment?"* Part of Luzzi's answer stated that he [Luzzi] was *"amazed that [Amy] was made a pastor in a place where something happened before,"* and that *"there certainly should have been something in his Seminary day files."* Luzzi added, *"I personally wondered when these things would resurface."*

In Muroski statement, he flatly denied any knowledge of Amy's predatory behavior at Camp Notre Dame. This behavior included the very incident that he, Luzzi and Speice helped to cover up by interceding with the victims' parents and the Pennsylvania State Police. Muroski wrote, *"Not to my knowledge. In fact, I've heard positive comment about him. I believe he's a hard and conscientious worker."*

On September 29, 1993, Speice answered the same question by writing, *"It is my understanding now that Mike's conduct through the years may have caused scandal or wonderment to some extent to some persons. I know no detail in this regard and am aware of the possibility only after the fact."* He then adds, *"One instance before ordination is a dim memory of mine and probably was a source of scandal at that time."*

After Amy's laicization process was finally concluded, an additional allegation was made against him stemming from an incident that happened in the early 1980s while the victim was a high school student at Erie Cathedral Preparatory. The victim e-mailed the Diocese on December 3, 2002 to report his molestation by Amy. He described how he had regarded Amy as a friend, mentor, and someone who always took time to listen to him. Then, one day when Amy got him alone in a confessional booth, Amy questioned him about touching himself. Amy then went on to fondle the victim on more than one occasion.

## Reverend Michael G. Barletta

### Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1939
YEAR OF DEATH:	Unknown
ORDINATION:	May 19, 1966

### Employment/Assignment History

6/04/1966 – 5/30/1975	Secondary Education Kennedy Catholic High School, Hermitage, PA
6/04/1966 – 6/03/1970	Weekend Asst. Sacred Heart, Sharon, PA
6/03/1970 – 6/30/1975	Weekend Asst. St. Joseph, Sharon, PA
1975	Teen Action Club at Cathedral Preparatory, Erie, PA
5/30/1975 – 9/07/1994	Secondary Education Erie Cathedral Preparatory HS
5/30/1975 – 9/07/1994	Weekend Assistant, St Luke's, Erie, PA
9/07/1994 – 8/01/1995	Sabbatical, Other Sabbatical at Southdown Treatment Center Toronto, Canada for Psychological Treatment
8/01/1995 – 2/28/2002	Dioceses Office, Catholic Charities, Erie, PA
8/01/1995 – 2/28/2002	Dioceses Office, Office of Matrimonial Concerns, Erie, PA
8/01/1995 – 2/28/2002	Resident St. Patrick's Resident, Erie, PA
2/28/2002	Retired

### Summary

The Grand Jury received several documents describing Father Michael Barletta's behavior and also heard the testimony of a retired priest who witnessed Barletta with his genitalia exposed in the presence of a child under the age of eighteen years old. This incident occurred between 1969 and 1970. Specifically, on a Saturday afternoon at St Joseph's church in Sharon, Barletta was scheduled to hear confessions along with fellow priest Father John Fischer. When Barletta failed to arrive, Fischer went looking for him. Fischer testified that he walked in on Barletta and a young high school student in Barletta's locked private chambers. Upon entering the room, Fischer observed this young student totally naked from the waist down, with his genitalia exposed. As Fischer withdrew from Barletta's room, he observed the child attempting to pull up his underwear and pants while Barletta stood in the corner and watched. Fischer did not call the police nor notify Barletta's supervisor. Instead, Fischer testified that he reported the incident to a fellow priest and to Bishop Watson, head of the Erie Diocese, two months later. He recalled that Monsignor Hastings dismissed his report of Barletta and the naked child. He also recalled his meeting with Watson and testified that both Hastings and Watson brushed him off and told him to, "Go home, be a good priest." Fischer also testified that when he told his fellow priests about Barletta and the child, they laughed it off. Not long after this incident, Barletta was re-assigned to Erie Cathedral Preparatory.

## Summary

Fischer referred to the Erie Cathedral Preparatory students who received most of Barletta's attention as Barletta's "pretty people." These children participated in a program that Barletta started and called the Teen Action Club ("TAC"). This club was made up of students who were active in the community, church, athletics, and academics. Barletta would provide the students with a shoulder rub, hypnosis, or massage. He would often take his students on vacation with him to places such as Niagara Falls or to his own private camp in a secluded, rural part of Pennsylvania.

In Bishop Trautman's handwritten notes, he recorded the details of a conversation that he had with Sister Donna Markham about Barletta. In those notes, Trautman wrote that Barletta has abused 25 children. Trautman noted that Barletta admitted to the number himself. Trautman also noted that Barletta needed a restricted ministry, possibly a nursing apostolate. He added that Barletta was very defensive and that his abuse included nudity and rub downs, including genital groping, and that Barletta vacationed exclusively with teens.

Barletta was confronted with allegations of oral sex, naked massages, digital anal penetration, and masturbation against a victim in 1994. When confronted, Barletta admitted his guilt to Trautman. This abuse took place when the first victim was a freshman at Erie Cathedral Preparatory. The Diocese paid for the victim's counseling. However, once the victim shared the sexual abuse with the newspaper, Trautman advised that the first victim should seek payment directly from Barletta.

In August of 1994, Monsignor Lawrence Speice notified Bishop Trautman of an allegation from Victim #1, who reported that Barletta or "Barts," attempted to use hypnosis techniques, in conjunction with rub downs, in sexual encounters that included mutual masturbation. Victim #1 reported that "Barts" had a fascination with Victim #1's uncircumcised penis compared to his own and had Victim #1 masturbate while he watched. The Diocese confronted Barletta with Victim #1's accusation, which he denied. The Diocese nevertheless ended up paying out \$14,420.00 to Victim #1.

Victim #2 was a high school senior when he and Victim #1 went on a retreat to Toronto, Canada, with Barletta. In the hotel room, Barletta engaged the boys in nude massages, relaxation techniques, fondling, and eventually masturbation. Barletta denied any sexual encounter with Victim #2, but in his April 2012 letter to the Bishop, Barletta admits to vacationing in Toronto with Victim #2 and Victim #1.

Victim #3 was another of Barletta's victims but little information has been found about him in the Diocese-supplied files. He is referenced as possibly one of the boys who went to the press with Victim #1 about Barletta. The Diocese lists Victim #3 as a victim in their 2003 report to John Jay College with no further details included. That report was compiled nationally by the John Jay College in New York in an attempt to quantify the scope of the problem of child sexual abuse within the Roman Catholic Church. The Grand Jury has found that many dioceses minimized the number of offenders and victims in their responses to this survey.

## Summary

Victim #4 was listed as “*Not Verified*” in the 2003 John Jay Report and few files were turned over by the Diocese pursuant to the subpoena by the Grand Jury. Victim #4’s name was found on handwritten notes from Bishop Trautman, who recorded Victim #4 as having traveled to Niagara Falls with Barletta. In those notes Trautman wrote, “*2 bed, rub down, masturbated, run off to bathroom and tried same thing.*”

Victim #5 had a conversation with Bishop Trautman in 2004 about his abuse at the hands of Barletta. Trautman’s notes recorded that Barletta gave Victim #5 several massages during his Junior and Senior years at Erie Cathedral Preparatory. Trautman noted that Barletta attempted to sexually abuse Victim #5 and that Victim #5 wanted to support his friends who were abused, so he came forward to report Barletta’s advances. In the John Jay Report, the Diocese lists Victim #5 as “*Allegation Withdrawn.*”

Victim #6 was another high school-aged student whose life was impacted by Barletta’s predation. Victim #6’s incident occurred while he was a student at Kennedy Catholic. Victim #6 reported his abuse in 2003 to Trautman and the Bishop confronted Barletta about the incident. At this time, Victim #6 was going through a divorce and came forward to the Diocese for assistance. In his conversation with the Bishop, Barletta admitted to giving Victim #6 a rub down, but did not admit to any further sexual contact. This conversation with Barletta was noted by Trautman on October 2, 2003. In that same document, Trautman made several notes regarding Barletta and Victim #6, such as “*gave massage to calm him, perhaps no clothes and stripped down.*”

Victim #7 was a Kennedy Catholic student who found himself in a vulnerable position at Barletta’s camp. Victim #7 was part of a group of boys who were taken to the camp, where Barletta suggested naked massages. Victim #7 refused and reported that he was never touched on that trip. Victim #7 reported this attempted sexual assault to Monsignor James Burke on November 4, 1988. That complaint was consistent with his complaint to Monsignor Robert Smith on November 25, 2003. However, in his report to Smith, Victim #7 added that he was now aware of several other children who had fallen victim to Barletta.

At the time of Victim #7’s original report to Monsignor Burke in 1988, Barletta was a full-time teacher at Erie Cathedral Preparatory and actively abusing students. Neither Burke nor the Diocese took any action as a result of the 1988 report. Burke memorialized Victim #7’s complaint on January 14, 1991. In a written report to Trautman, Burke explained Victim #7’s complaint and concluded writing, “*I didn’t feel the need to go any further with this at this time.*”

In Victim #7’s 2003 conversation with Smith, he reported that he was mad at the Diocese for its failure to remove Barletta sooner. Victim #7 told Smith that when he made his report to Burke in 1988, the Diocese already knew about Barletta as far back as his days at Kennedy Christian, yet they did nothing. This is an accurate statement. Father Fischer, Bishop Watson and Father Hastings all knew that Fischer had observed Barletta commit a sex crime against a child, yet Fischer was directed to remain silent by Bishop Watson.

## Summary

In 2009, after many years of counseling, Victim #8 notified the Diocese of his abuse at the hands of Barletta. His account is consistent with the tactics that Barletta used against other children. Bishop Trautman documented his conversation with Victim #8 on September 10, 2009. Trautman noted that Victim #8 was befriended by Barletta, taken to a rural farm owned by Barletta in DuBois and abused. Trautman noted that Barletta was “*a calculated abuser who tried to hypnotize him.*”

From 1975 through 1994, when he was finally dismissed from Erie Cathedral Preparatory, Barletta admittedly abused 25 children and young men. After 1994, there are reports and documents that proved that Barletta was allowed to continue ministering to the faithful in the Diocese of Erie. He was appointed to be an Assessor in the Diocesan Tribunal in July 1995 and was appointed to work in the Office of Catholic Charities in 1997. These assignments were granted after Bishop Trautman discovered Barletta’s misdeeds and removed him from public ministry. In one document, written in 1997, Barletta was congratulated on his “*outstanding sermons at Carmel*” by Bishop Trautman.

In 1994, the Diocese listed Barletta as being on sabbatical. He had actually been sent to the Southdown Treatment Center. This information was never released to the parishioners of the Diocese of Erie. Barletta was housed, fed and given therapy at Southdown at a significant cost to the parishioners of Erie, which is detailed in the Diocesan records.

Deeper in the recesses of the diocesan secret archives was a handwritten note from 1968. In this note, Bishop Watson wrote that Barletta “*Spends much time in counselling high school boys – a small number only.*” Thus, the concerns regarding Barletta appear to have been raised early in his career. Diocesan files indicate that in 1993, Monsignor Andrew Karg received a complaint from five fellow priests expressing serious concerns about Barletta. On April 29, 1993, Karg wrote to Trautman about the priests’ fears that Barletta could be “*crossing the line*” into the private lives of the students at Preparatory. Karg adds that Barletta is known to take pictures inside the boys’ locker room of the kids’ crotch area and that Barletta maintains a book of “*crotch shots*” in his residence. These priests questioned Barletta’s personal vacations with the good looking boys and his trips to San Francisco with students. In another bullet point, Karg reported “*Father Dollinger’s*” fear is that if the Catholic Preparatory school ever had a law suit about a pedophile, “*will the 18 years of Father Barletta also come to light?*”

## Father Donald C. Bolton, C.S.S.R.

### Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1926
YEAR OF DEATH:	Unknown
ORDINATION:	1952

### Employment/Assignment History

1952 – 1954	Mt. St. Alphonsus, Esopus, NY
1954 – 1959	Bela Vista, Mato Grosso, Brazil
1959 – 1962	Campo Grande, Mato Grosso, Brazil
1962 – 1967	Bela Vista, Mato Grosso, Brazil
1967 – 1969	Monte Alegre, Parana, Brazil
1969 – 1970	Rocio, Parana, Brazil
1970 – 1974	Notre Dame Retreat House, Canadaigua, NY
1974 – 1984	St. Gregory Thaumaturgus, North East, PA
1984 – 1987	Our Lady of Perpetual Help Basilica, Brooklyn, NY
1987 – 1990	Holy Family Retreat House, Hampton, VA
1990 – 2003	St. Alphonsus Villa, Redemptorist Fathers and Brothers, New Smyrna Beach, FL
2003 – 2006	St. John Neumann Residence, Sarasota Springs, FL
10/27/2006	Death

### Summary

In 1986, the parents of a seven-year-old girl came forward to the Erie County District Attorney's Office with a complaint that Father Donald C. Bolton molested their daughter. They came forward after they discovered that Bolton was working with children in New York. They had been promised by Bolton's holy order, The Redemptorists, that he would never again be in a position to harm children. As a result of this complaint, Bolton was charged with indecent assault and corruption of minors. He pled guilty in 1987 and was sentenced to three years' probation. Records from that arrest also noted that several other girls were molested as well, but the statute of limitations had already expired, thus prohibiting further prosecution.

One of Bolton's victims would later file a lawsuit and received a settlement of \$100,000. This victim was labeled Jane Doe 1 in court records. Jane Doe 1's lawsuit named the following defendants: The Redemptorists Mission of the Baltimore Province, Most Reverend(s) Kevin Moley and Joseph Kenan (Redemptorists), The Diocese of Erie, Bishop(s) Donald Trautman and Michael Murphy.

Jane Doe 1's abuse began in 1976 when she was seven years old and continued until she was eleven years old. In 1976, Bolton came to her house to console her family over the death

## Summary

of a grandparent. Jane Doe 1 reported that Bolton held her on his lap and rubbed her back, legs, bottom, and rear.

Bolton's second assault on Jane Doe 1 occurred in 1977, when she was eight-years-old. This time, Jane Doe 1 was preparing to make her First Holy Communion at St. Gregory. When she was practicing confession, Bolton entered her side of the confession booth. He then slid his hands up her dress and pulled her panties down. He fondled her and rubbed his penis against her. When Bolton was done, he instructed Jane Doe 1 not to tell anyone because no one would believe a child's word against his word. Jane Doe 1 recalled this type of abuse occurred for nine months, at least every other week.

Beginning in 1977 and continuing into 1978, Bolton took Jane Doe 1 and her five friends to the Peak 'N Peak ski resort in New York on several occasions. Bolton would take the girls to the swimming pool at the resort. Once they were done swimming, Bolton towed the girls off and drove them home. Jane Doe 1 explained that while Bolton drove, he assaulted her in the front seat. She described how Bolton would rub her genitals and poke her with his finger as though he was trying to put a hole in her pants. Jane Doe 1 recalled this as a physically painful experience. She recalled that it happened to her at least twice when she was eight or nine years old.

In 1978 and 1979, Jane Doe 1 attended Confraternity of Christian Doctrine ("CCD") classes at St. Gregory. Her classes met every Wednesday night during the regular school year from September to June. Jane Doe 1 reported that Bolton would have the nuns pull her out of class and send her to Bolton's bedroom in the rectory to help him with assignments. This happened approximately every other week. Once in Bolton's bedroom, he would take off her pants and put her on his lap. She recalled that she would be in a position that her back was to him. When in this position, Bolton would rub his penis back and forth on her buttocks and vagina while he moaned and groaned. Bolton told Jane Doe 1 that he was preparing her for womanhood. She added that while he would rub himself on her, he often had his hand and fingers inside her vagina. When Bolton came close to ejaculation he would simply move Jane Doe 1 slightly forward with his hand inside her vagina being careful not ejaculate on her.

Bolton's last series of assaults on Jane Doe 1 occurred when she was eleven-years-old at Lake Chautauqua in New York. Her parents rented a cottage in the resort town and invited Bolton along for the family vacation. Her family was vacationing with at least two other girls. These were two of the girls who had accompanied her and Bolton on the trips to Peak 'N Peak. One day when Jane Doe 1 was done swimming with these two friends, Bolton found her alone in her bedroom. Bolton closed the door behind him, proceeded to pull off her bathing suit and turned her around. Bolton began to masturbate himself while inserting his fingers into Jane Doe 1's vagina. Jane Doe 1 recalled this incident in particular because Bolton placed his fingers far enough inside her to hurt her. She recalled that the assault only stopped when he thought he was going to be discovered by a passerby. Once again, Bolton instructed Jane Doe 1 to be quiet about the abuse because she was a lying child and nobody would believe a lying child over a man of God's word.

## Summary

Jane Doe 1 finally began to disclose the abuse in 1993. That year, while attending a funeral for an in-law, Bishop Michael Murphy was introduced to her in the funeral home lobby. Jane Doe 1 had an emotional breakdown. She thereafter sought counseling. Bishop Donald Trautman's handwritten note documents that Bolton's Redemptorists Order paid \$50,000.00 and the Diocese of Erie's insurance carrier paid the balance.

Jane Doe 1 reported that she never witnessed Bolton assault any of her friends, but believes they were also abused. She believes several, if not all, of her five friends with whom she travelled to New York in the company of Bolton were assaulted in the same fashion as she was. Diocesan records confirm part of her suspicions. The complainant in Bolton's 1987 conviction was indeed one of Jane Doe 1's friends. Other victims of Bolton's predation came forward years later and also proved to be childhood friends of Jane Doe 1. The Diocesan records show correspondence with some of these victims. One female victim was with Jane Doe 1 on her trips to Peak 'N Peak and also with her on the family vacation to Lake Chautauqua, New York. This young victim was approximately the same age as Jane Doe, between seven and eleven years old, when Bolton preyed upon her. The Diocesan records documented the efforts the Diocese of Erie and the Redemptorists Order went through to get this victim and her son counseling. As of 2003, both religious orders were in correspondence with this victim to assist her. No mention of a lawsuit or cash settlement was found in her file.

In another file, the mother of five children alleged that Bolton may have sexually assaulted four of them. No details of their assault were provided to the Grand Jury; however, as of 2004, the Diocese of Erie's representative, Monsignor Robert Smith, on behalf of Bishop Donald Trautman, was corresponding with the family to offer them counseling assistance.

Bolton's only other documented victim was a fourth grade boy who was abused between 1976 and 1977. Diocesan representative Monsignor Mark L. Bartchak made contact with him in 2001 and reported his findings back to Monsignor Robert Smith and Bishop Trautman. This victim reported that Bolton sexually assaulted him. Internal documents from Bartchak to Smith record the Diocese's preparation for a lawsuit and their intention to notify the Redemptorists of this victim's possible course of action. The Diocese made arrangements to have a representative from Catholic Charities counsel the victim and to arrange for various agencies to assist him and his family financially and by providing food aid.

In 2001, Monsignor Smith met with this victim in person to record his complaints. When asked about Bolton's abuse, this victim reported that he had a desire to be an altar server and went to Bolton's office one day to inquire about it. The victim explained that when he opened the door without knocking, he saw Father Bolton with a young girl whose tights were down around her ankles. He told Smith that this girl was crying and that Bolton yelled at him, "*What the hell are you doing here?*" His only other answer to inquiries about Bolton was to say that Bolton "*Wanted me to do things to him.*" He implied that these things that Bolton suggested were sexual and that Father Bolton asked this victim to touch him.

In the Diocese response to the John Jay College Study in 2003, the Diocese of Erie listed this last victim as "*Not Verified*".

## **Summary**

Ultimately, the Diocese of Erie returned Bolton to his religious order. The Redemptorists continued to place Bolton in ministry until his death in 2006.

## Reverend Robert F. Bower

### Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1932
YEAR OF DEATH:	
ORDINATION:	May 7, 1959

### Employment/Assignment History

5/23/1959 – 8/29/1964	Gannon University, Erie, PA
8/29/1964 – 6/03/1970	Parochial Vicar, Our Lady of the Lake, Edinboro, PA
6/03/1970 – 8/20/1993	Faculty, Newman Center, Edinboro University
8/29/1992 – 3/11/1999	Pastor, St Anthony, Cambridge Springs, PA
8/29/1992 – N/A	Resident, other, Private Residence, Edinboro, PA
8/31/1993 – 8/29/1998	Weekend Asst., Our Lady of the Lake, Edinboro, PA
3/11/1999 – 3/01/2001	Leave of Absence.
3/01/2001 – N/A	Special ministry, Weekend Asst. Johnsonburg, nursing home, Meadville, PA

### Summary

Reverend Robert Bower was a priest who served in campus ministry for over 40 years in the Diocese of Erie. In 1981, Bower was found to have collected child pornography photographs. Seventh grade children found these images in Bower's office while they served as janitors at the Edinboro University Newman Center. One of these children, now an adult, testified to the images before the Grand Jury. The witness testified that he and his friends found several photographs and pamphlets in Bower's office depicting children having sex with adults. He testified that he told his mother about it

The witness's mother began working for the Diocese in 1977. In 1981, she was fired two days after she and her three coworkers reported that Bower had a problem with child pornography. Another Diocesan employee testified before the Grand Jury that at approximately the same time the students found child pornography in Bower's office, she also found illegal pornography on his desk. She testified that, as Bower's secretary, she collected it and hid it away so none of the children who frequented Bower's office would come across it.

The four coworkers first took their findings to the Father Doleski. After they showed Doleski what was found in Bower's office, he suggested that they see Bishop Murphy. They requested a meeting with Murphy. Murphy delayed the meeting for weeks. Only after the women threatened to go to the media did Murphy finally agree to meet with them.

In their meeting with Murphy, the women explained that they did not wish to get Bower in trouble; rather, they wanted him to get help for his issues with child pornography. Both

## Summary

witnesses testified that Murphy preached to them and made them feel guilty to the point that they left the meeting in tears. They were told they were destroying Bower and the Church.

Two days after the meeting with the Bishop, one of the witnesses was notified that the Diocese had fired her without reason. Over the course of the next several years, she was denied jobs in the area and another witness was denied promotions inside the Diocese where she still worked. This witness testified that she kept the child pornography that she found that day in Bower's office for 17 years hoping that someday someone would believe her story. Both women were concerned that the influence of the Diocese could destroy their lives. Father Bower continued in ministry unabated.

In 1999, the Pennsylvania State Police received a telephone call from a local computer repair company. Technicians reported that they had a computer in their store with suspected child pornography on it. That computer belonged to Bower. The Grand Jury heard testimony from a former Pennsylvania State Trooper and from Bower himself confirming the presence of this child pornography on the computer. While Bower initially confessed to the Pennsylvania State Police, he minimized the significance of the material when he appeared before the Grand Jury and indicated he was unsure as to how the now-lost material came to be on his computer. Criminal charges were filed but were later dropped due to improper handling of the evidence.

During the timeframe of the 1999 investigation, the two aforementioned Diocesan employees took action. The women took their long-held collection of Bower's child pornography to the State Police. Both women reported that the State Police took the Bower material. The women hoped that their preservation of this evidence would result in some action or aid the existing case, but no additional charges were ever filed and the materials were destroyed.

Bower retired from active ministry in the early 2000's but continues to live on the campus of Edinboro University.

The Grand Jury found the testimony of the witnesses to be credible. It was Bower's own testimony, however, that most disturbed the Grand Jury. When the attorney for the Commonwealth asked Bower if he had ever had sexual contact with a child under the age of eighteen. Bower answered, "*What am I supposed to say?*" When the prosecutor persisted, Bower added, "*I'll go to jail.*"

# Reverend Dennis Chludzinski

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1946
YEAR OF DEATH:	N/A
ORDINATION:	May 14, 1976

## Employment/Assignment History

6/05/1976 – 6/02/1977	Sacred Heart, Sharon, PA
6/03/1977 – 1/23/1978	Holy Rosary, Erie, PA
1/24/1978 – 6/30/1979	Leave of Absence
7/01/1979 – 8/24/1980	Unassigned / Under Father Kelly's Supervision
8/25/1980 – 6/00/1984	Faculty at Villa Maria High School Erie, PA St. Benedict's Academy Erie, PA Mercyhurst Preparatory Erie, PA
6/00/1984 – 10/08/1984	Attending Gannon University, Our Lady of Mercy
10/09/1985 – 8/31/1986	No Information provided by the Diocese of Erie
9/01/1986 - 8/02/1987	Chaplain, Sisters Community at Mercyhurst College, Hamot Medical Center

## Summary

The Grand Jury reviewed the files of the Diocese of Erie with respect to Father Dennis Chludzinski. The record contained evidence that the Diocese became aware of sexual misconduct by Chludzinski as early as 1984 that occurred while he was on the faculty of Villa Maria High School.

In notarized testimony to the Diocese of Erie, Chludzinski admitted that in 1984, while he was assigned as a Chaplain at Mercyhurst High School, he had inappropriate sexual contact with an 18-year-old boy in his senior year. He stated that the abuse occurred in 1984, possibly extending into 1985. In a letter dated January 30, 1991 addressed to Bishop Donald Trautman and detailing his progress in therapy, Chludzinski admitted that he and a friend engaged in sexual contact with an 18-year-old male from his high school. This included mutual masturbation and oral sex. The sexual contact occurred approximately four times.

Similarly, in notarized testimony, Chludzinski admitted that after being granted a leave from the Chaplain position at Mercyhurst High School, he became sexually involved with a 14-year-old boy for approximately nine months. He stated that this abuse occurred in 1984 and possibly 1985. The victim said that Chludzinski introduced him to his homosexual lifestyle.

Finally, a letter dated July 26, 2004 to Monsignor Robert J. Smith, Vicar General, from Monsignor Mark L. Bartchak reported that a father recently discovered that Chludzinski had molested his young son years ago during a camping trip. A file note dated September 20, 2004,

## Summary

written by Smith, records that he and Bartchak met with the victim on September 17, 2004. The victim reported that he met Chludzinski while he was an altar boy at Our Lady of Mercy. He said that Chludzinski kissed him, touched his genitals, and engaged in oral sex with him on at least one occasion. On another occasion, Chludzinski shoved his hands down the victim's pants while driving a car. The abuse happened for about six months between the years 1983 and 1985 and occurred approximately six times. The victim reported that another altar boy was also abused.

On October 1, 2004, Bishop Trautman notified the Erie County District Attorney's Office of the allegation.

In a memorandum to file dated October 2, 2004, Bishop Trautman memorialized that he had called and informed Chludzinski of the allegation. Chludzinski replied, "Sorry." A second handwritten note by Trautman stated, "*On Oct. 6 Dennis Chuldzinski called and admitted sexual involvement with (the victim).*"

# Father Donald Cooper

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1936
YEAR OF DEATH:	December 16, 2011
ORDINATION:	May 23, 1963

## Employment/Assignment History

6/1963-5/1964	Bradford Central High Christian High School, Bradford, PA
5/1964-6/1971	St. Titus, Titusville, PA
6/1971-6/1975	St. George, Erie, PA
6/1975-11/1984	St. Charles, New Bethlehem, PA
11/1984-6/1987	Mount Calvary, Erie, PA
6/1987-3/1988	Assumption, Oil City, PA
3/1988-6/1989	St. Catherine, DuBois, PA
3/1988-4/1989	St. Anthony, Walston, PA
6/1989-7/2002	St. Joseph, Force, PA
7/2002-6/2005	Christ the King, Houtzdale, PA
10/2002-6/2005	Holy Trinity, Ramey, PA
6/2005	Retired

## Summary

In 2005, a 40-year-old man sent an e-mail communication to the Diocese of Erie to report that he had been subjected to inappropriate sexual contact by Father Donald Cooper between 1981 and 1982. Cooper was a priest at St. Charles during the time period of the allegation. The victim stated that Cooper had abused him multiple times over that time period and had left him with years of emotional trauma.

The victim explained that, at the time, he was a 16-year-old boy who was looking for spiritual fulfillment in his life. His immediate family were not church goers, but the victim was introduced to the Catholic church by a family friend. The victim soon took a strong liking to the faith and wanted to learn more about it. The victim was attending St. Charles when Cooper offered him personalized catechism lessons to instruct him in the faith. Over time, a relationship developed and Cooper started to take the victim on overnight trips where they would stay in various hotels and motels. Cooper would convince the young victim to take a shower with him or to spend time with him in a sauna. This is when the molestation would take place. Cooper would massage the victim and fondle his genitals. The victim was also subjected to Cooper masturbating in front of him. The abuse took place in various hotels and also occurred in the church rectory. The victim stated that a retired priest, Father William Smith, lived in the rectory and knew of the abuse but did nothing about it.

## **Summary**

When the victim reported the abuse in 2005, an internal investigation was conducted by Monsignor Robert Smith. When confronted, Cooper admitted that he did shower and use the sauna with the victim, and that he gave the victim massages. However, he did not admit to the masturbation. Once the interviews were conducted, it was the opinion of Smith that the victim was telling the truth and that his account was credible. Cooper agreed that he would retire and would no longer be able to serve as a priest. Additionally, the church and the victim came to an agreement wherein the Diocese would pay for the victim's past and future therapy sessions and medication and also pay off \$19,530 of the victim's personal debt.

# Father Michael Robert Freeman

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1946
YEAR OF DEATH:	N/A
ORDINATION:	May 27, 1972

## Employment/Assignment History

6/10/1972	St. Margaret, Buffalo, NY
2/15/1975	St. Lawrence, Buffalo Part-time teacher, Bishop Turner High School
7/31/1976	Sacred Heart, Niagara Falls, NY
7/01/1980	Chaplain, United States Army
11/09/1981	Ecclesiastical Endorsement revoked
9/11/1982	St. Christopher, Tonawanda, PA
9/01/1984	St. Mary, Lancaster, PA
3/21/1989	Faculties Revoked

## Summary

Based on the information provided to the Grand Jury by the Diocese of Erie, the Grand Jury learned that Father Robert Freeman had some contact with the Diocese of Erie but he was not incardinated into the Diocese as a Diocesan priest. In fact, Freeman was a Priest in the Diocese of Buffalo, New York. Father Freeman was ordained May 27, 1972. In five of his six subsequent assignments he admitted inappropriate sexual behavior with young men on multiple occasions. These instances of sexual abuse occurred while he acted in his capacity as a priest of the Diocese of Buffalo but while he ministered in various assignments to include locations within Pennsylvania. The Diocese of Buffalo first became aware of Freeman's criminal activity in November 1981. Freeman admitted prior sexual misconduct at both St. Margaret and St. Lawrence Parishes in New York. This included his term of service at Bishop Turner High School. The Buffalo Diocese continued to permit Freeman to serve in active ministry until March 1989 and continued to provide financial aid to Freeman until July 31, 1999, at which time he informed the Diocese that his salary and health insurance would be covered by his new employer.

The Grand Jury found no documentation in Freeman's file that indicated that the Dioceses of Buffalo or Erie ever notified law enforcement officials, despite the fact that Freeman admitted to sexually violating children in at least five of his six ministry assignments. On two occasions he was treated at the Southdown Institute, a psychiatric facility for clergy and religious personnel in Aurora, Ontario. While one of Freeman's assignments was as a military chaplain, locations within Pennsylvania at which Freeman may have sexually abused children include the counties of Bradford and Lancaster.

# Reverend Gregory P. Furjanic

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1945
YEAR OF DEATH:	N/A
ORDINATION:	Unknown

## Employment/Assignment History

1985	Staff, Kennedy Catholic High School
1985 - Unknown	Unknown duties, St. Anthony of Padua Sharon, PA
1987 – Unknown	Residing in a Convent at 1039 East 27 <sup>th</sup> Street., Erie PA
7/08/1996	Faculties removed
2003 – Unknown	Croatian Franciscan Friars, Chicago, IL.
2005 - Unknown	Lutheran Social Services, St. Petersburg, FL

## Summary

Reverend Gregory P. Furjanic served in the St. Anthony of Padua parish as a religious Friar attached to the Croatian Franciscan Friars out of Chicago, Illinois. At that time, the Diocese of Erie permitted an outside religious order priest to handle the ministry in one of their parishes. The Diocese retained minimal paperwork on Furjanic, since he was technically not one of their priests.

In 2005, there was an accusation made against Furjanic related to an incident that occurred in the early 1970s. The second incident occurred in the mid-1980s. Then, the records showed that in the 1990s an accusation against Furjanic came into the Diocese. The Diocese sent Furjanic to the Erie Ecclesia center for counseling and then on to the St. Luke's Institute for advanced counseling. His case was ultimately forwarded to the Congregation for Institutions of Consecrated Life and of Societies of Apostolic Life. On July 8, 1996, the Congregation removed Furjanic's priestly authority.

The Grand Jury learned that one of Furjanic's victims later took his own life.

In 2005, an individual from Lutheran Social Services in St. Petersburg, Florida contacted Father Robert Smith, Vicar General of the Diocese of Erie, to investigate Furjanic's history. Furjanic had allegedly attempted to obtain religious credentials in Mobile, Alabama and in St. Petersburg, but was rejected based upon his past history. It was documented that Furjanic represented himself as a clergy member associated with Lutheran Ministry and had the title "Reverend" on his business cards.

# Father Herbert G. Gloekler

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1923
YEAR OF DEATH:	1985
ORDINATION:	June 4, 1949

## Employment/Assignment History

6/1949-9/1967	Sacred Heart, Erie, PA
9/1967-10/1974	St. Bibiana, Galetton, PA
10/1974-1/1985	Mount Calvary, Erie, PA
1/1985	Died, St. Mary's Home

## Summary

Father Herbert Gloekler was accused of sexually abusing young females during the 1950s while serving as a priest at Sacred Heart. Most of the allegations involved girls who helped to sort paperwork in the rectory.

An April 28, 2002 Erie Times-News article described the abuse of the first victim while she was a student at Sacred Heart School in the 1950s. She wanted to bring to light the abuse that had taken place for years within the Catholic church. In addition to the article, on March 21, 2002, the victim had sent an e-mail communication to Bishop Trautman requesting that the church stop the abuse and help the victims who suffered from sexual abuse.

The second victim wrote a letter to Trautman in May 2002 in order to support the claims that had been set forth in the newspaper article. She was a student at Sacred Heart School in the late 1950s. She remembered that she, a female classmate (Victim #1), and Victim #2's sister (Victim #3) would assist Gloekler in the rectory by folding church bulletins. Victim #2 stated that Gloekler would fondle all of their breasts by putting his hand down their shirts. He would also look down their dresses in the summer time to check for sunburn. Victim #2's sister confided in her that Gloekler once took her into his bedroom while they were alone in the rectory. It was not until Victim #3 was an adult that she was able to tell anyone that Gloekler had raped her.

Victim #4 wrote a letter to Bishop Trautman in May of 2002 and referenced the news article in the Erie Times-News. Victim #4 stated that she was a student at Sacred Heart School and would help in the rectory on Fridays along with other female students. She was excited to have to opportunity to work with Gloekler. As a gesture of thanks to the girls who had assisted him at the rectory, Gloekler planned to take them out for dinner. Before dinner, however, Gloekler stopped at his mother's house with the girls. Victim #4 stated that Gloekler pulled her into an empty room and kissed her. He instructed her that this interaction was to be keep private. The next week, Victim #4 returned to the rectory to help on Friday. Gloekler pulled her aside

## Summary

again into a room where he kissed her and molested her. This was the last time that she helped at the rectory.

There were two additional women who came forward and contacted Bishop Trautman about sexual abuse that they had witnessed, but were not victims themselves. One of the woman who came forward was a nun in the Catholic Church who wrote a letter to Bishop Trautman in April of 2002. She was prompted to write the letter to corroborate Victim #1's sexual abuse claims in the April 28, 2002 article in the Erie Times-News. The nun was a classmate of Victim #1 at Sacred Heart School. While she was a student, she had heard other students' state that Gloekler had sexually abused them.

A second woman wrote an e-mail directly to Bishop Trautman on June 1, 2002. She was a student of Sacred Heart School from 1957-1959, and she would help fold the church bulletins on Fridays. In the e-mail, she recalled witnessing Gloekler fondling young girls' breasts in front of her. Her e-mail was also intended to help substantiate the accusation of Victim #1.

An allegation was brought against Gloekler by a female housekeeper at Mt. Calvary Church in Erie, a church where Gloekler had served as a priest in 1974. This woman said that she was the housekeeper for Gloekler before his replacement, Father Cooper, took over and eventually fired her. This woman indicated that she had knowledge that both Gloekler and Cooper were involved in sexual misconduct. She made this accusation in August of 2003 when she appeared in person at the St. Mark's Catholic Center in Erie. Although the former housekeeper did not state that she wanted money, she inferred that she had an arrangement with Gloekler for her to receive a pension. The Diocese responded to her by saying that there was not a pension agreement in place and accordingly no money had been deducted from her pay. The Diocese did not mention the abuse allegation. There were no further documents or follow-up reports regarding this allegation in the files.

## Father Robert E. Hannon

### Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1926
YEAR OF DEATH:	2006
ORDINATION:	May 27, 1954

### Employment/Assignment History

6/03/1954 – 2/03/1955	Assistant Pastor, Holy Rosary, Erie, PA,
2/03/1955 – 3/27/1957	Assistant Pastor, Sacred Heart, Sharon, PA
3/27/1957 – 2/03/1958	Assistant Pastor, St. Boniface, Kersey, PA
2/03/1958– 5/31/1958	Resident Pastor (Hacherl) asked to have Hannon Removed Assistant Pastor, St Luke’s, Erie, PA Resident Pastor (Goodill) asked to have Hannon Removed
5/31/1958 – 6/12/1965	Administrator, Sacred Heart, Genesee, PA
9/01/1959 – N/A	Appointed Assistant Director of Lay Retreats for the Diocese
6/12/1965 – 6/4/1966	Holy Cross, Brandy Camp, PA
6/04/1966 – N/A	Administrator, St. Mathew, Erie, PA
6/06/1966 – 6/16/1967	Administrator, St. Cyprian, Waterford, PA
6/16/1967 – 6/01/1979	Pastor, St. Mathew in the Wood, Erie, PA
4/13/1978	Requests transfer to Diocese of Hawaii
6/01/1979	Released to Diocese of Hawaii
9/19/1979 – 7/18/1980	Asst. Pastor, St. John the Apostle, HI
7/18/1980 – 6/1/1981	Associate Pastor, St. Cattistus, Kane, PA
6/01/1981	Associate Pastor, St. Elizabeth, Aiea, HI
4/26/1984	Holy Trinity Church, Honolulu, HI
7/17/1984	Incardinated into Diocese of Hawaii
10/20/2003 – 1/16/2006	Residence at Cathedral of Our Lady of Peace, Diocese of Hawaii, Honolulu, HI
1/16/2006	Death Announcement

### Summary

Father Robert Hannon was a Roman Catholic Priest who was posted in several states and abused children in each Diocese to which he was assigned. In 1962, he began his ministry in the Diocese of Erie, where he was assigned until 1978. At that time, Hannon turned his attention toward the Diocese of Hawaii.

In 2003, in response to the John Jay College study on clergy sexual abuse, the Diocese of Erie acknowledged the existence of eight known victims of Hannon’s sexual assaults. The Grand Jury has found from subpoenaed documents that as early as 1986 that the Diocese of Hawaii, and possibly the Diocese of Erie as well, knew that Father Hannon had admittedly abused at least twenty youths between twelve and nineteen years of age. This admission came

## Summary

to light while Hannon was receiving treatment for his behavior at Foundation House, which is a psychiatric facility operated by servants of the Paraclete in New Mexico. Documentation was found in the subpoenaed files discussing which Diocese was going to foot the bill for Hannon's extensive treatment.

Of the eight victims acknowledged by the Diocese of Erie, one is categorized as "*claim denied, not verified*" based solely upon a denial by Hannon himself. That victim, Hannon's only known female victim, was abused in Hawaii by Hannon on one of his many trips to the islands before he was incardinated into the Diocese of Hawaii in 1979. This abuse occurred in approximately 1974 while Hannon was visiting Victim #1's parents in Hawaii. Victim #1 claims that while Hannon was tucking her and her sister into bed, he fondled her underneath her underpants. Victim #1 stated that this abuse happened more than once but she could not state a number of times she was abused.

In 2004, this female victim was interviewed by a professional chosen by the Diocese of Hawaii. Ms. Barbara Mullen, who worked in that Diocese with Victim Assistance for Catholic Charities, interviewed Victim #1 in February of 2004. It was the professional opinion of Mullen and Rev. Gary Secor from Hawaii that Victim #1's claims against Hannon were "*extremely credible*." Nonetheless, the Diocese of Erie sided with Hannon because he had previously admitted to abusing only boys. On May 5, 2004, Hannon denied having ever abused any females stating, "*They do not have a penis*."

Much, if not all, of Hannon's abuse came to light only after he was incardinated into the Diocese of Hawaii. This is why he received most of his professional counseling in the western part of the United States. The subpoenaed documents supplied to the Grand Jury contain voluminous correspondence between the two Dioceses discussing which was responsible for the costs of Hannon's care and pension. Also contained in this file is correspondence between Hannon and the Diocese of Erie. These letters consist of Hannon's apologies for all the trouble he has caused and acknowledgment of the funds sent back to the Erie Diocese by Hannon. These funds were sent to Erie to be applied toward financial settlements with his victims. In one such handwritten document, Hannon apologized to Bishop Trautman and thanked him for his phone call prior to Hannon's annual flight to Erie. Hannon expressed his concerns about airport security to Trautman and wrote that Trautman's call reminded him that cancelling his trip to Erie was "*a good thing – to avoid any warrants*."

As a result of Hannon's denial, Victim #1 was sent a letter by the law firm of Quinn, Buseck, Leemhuis, Toohey and Kroto, Inc. This is the law firm that represented the Diocese of Erie on January 3, 2005, when the letter was sent. In that document, Victim #1 was told that the Erie Review Board could not verify any of her allegations made against Hannon. The Diocese would agree to provide four to six months of counseling to assist her in reconciling her present situation, however. Attorney Kroto still works for the Diocese to this day.

Hannon's victims were, in most cases, the children of parishioners and/or altar servers. By his own admission, he would congratulate his altar servers after mass with a friendly hug and "a little green", as Hannon referred to cash. This hug and gift of money soon grew into an

## Summary

ostensible friendship between Hannon and his victims that helped pave the way for their exploitation. Another one of Hannon's methods was to ingratiate himself with his victims' families. Hannon was charming enough to get himself invited into his victims' homes to have drinks with their parents and even be invited to stay the night. Once the other adults were asleep, Hannon would molest his victims while their parents slept. Another one of Hannon's tactics was to take the children of parents he had befriended to his residence at the rectory for "sleep overs", where he would have unfettered access to the children.

The following is a brief recitation of Hannon's eight known victims within the Diocese of Erie. It is unknown to what extent, if any, the Diocese ever informed law enforcement officials about Hannon's conduct.

Victim #1, as detailed above, was Hannon's only known female victim. She was six to seven years old when Hannon fondled her. The Diocese of Hawaii found her claim to be credible but the Diocese of Erie did not and only offered to counsel her for four to six months.

Victim #2 was sixteen years old at the time of his sexual assault in the mid 1970's. Hannon testified at Victim #2's military court martial trial that he performed oral sex on Victim #2 at least twelve times when he was an altar server at Hannon's parish. Victim #2 was found guilty of espionage and sentenced to federal prison;

Victim #3 was twelve years old at the time Hannon fondled his genitals. The Diocese and Victim #3 came to a \$20,000 settlement in 2002.

Very little is documented by the Diocese about Victim #4, only that Bishop Trautman found his claim to be a "good report." Trautman notes that Hannon abused Victim #4 for over one-and-a-half years. Trautman offered to personally counsel Victim #4.

Victim #5 was fifteen to sixteen years old in 1978–1979 when Hannon abused him. Details of his abuse were not found in the Diocesan files. The Diocese settled with Victim #5 for \$5,000 on November 14, 2003, however. Also found in the Diocese files was a copy of a check written to the Diocese of Erie by Hannon dated November 3, 2003 in the amount of \$5,000.

Victim #6 was eight to ten years old in the late 1950's when Hannon befriended him, took him on trips, and engaged him in oral sex. This victim first notified the Diocese of Erie of his abuse in 1993, several years after Hannon went to Hawaii.

Victim #7 was approximately nine years old when Hannon began molesting him in 1976. His abuse lasted until 1981. Hannon endeared himself to Victim #7's family and was invited to their home for meals, holidays, and sleep-overs. Over these years, Hannon sexually abused Victim #7 late at night and forced him to pose in explicit positions that Hannon then photographed. Victim #7's parents became aware of Hannon's acts in 1981 and called for a meeting with the Bishop. This meeting never happened and Victim #7's parents let the matter drop. In 1995, Victim #7 and his family settled with the Diocese of Erie for \$39,000.

## Summary

Victim #8 was approximately eleven years old in the early 1970's when Hannon abused him. Hannon fondled him, had oral sex with him, and penetrated Victim #8's anus with his fingers. This abuse all occurred while Victim #8 worked as an alter server and performed cleaning duties at Hannon's parish. Victim #8 reported his abuse to Bishop Trautman in July 2006. Trautman noted that he assured Victim #8 and his wife that "*the priest accused of molesting him has long died.*" In reality, Hannon had only passed away six months prior.

These eight are only the known victims of Father Hannon. Hannon admitted to abusing at least twenty victims, which leads the Grand Jury to conclude that there were many more, as yet unknown, victims, both in the Diocese of Erie and in Hawaii. The investigation was unable to uncover the identities and experiences of these additional victims. This is due, in part, to the fact that the Grand Jury did not have access to the pertinent files from the Diocese of Hawaii.

Hannon passed away on January 16, 2006, while in residence at the Cathedral of Our Lady of Peace in the Diocese of Hawaii. He apparently remained in the good graces of both the Dioceses of Erie and Hawaii at the time of his death.

# Monsignor James P. Hopkins

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	Unknown
YEAR OF DEATH:	1957
ORDINATION:	N/A

## Employment/Assignment History

Unknown Dates:	Pastor St. Titus Church in Titusville, PA
1920s	Pastor at unknown church in East Brady, PA

## Summary

On August 3, 1993, a victim wrote a letter to Bishop Trautman at the Diocese of Erie. She stated in the letter that in 1945, when she was 13 years of age, she experienced abuse at the hands of Monsignor Hopkins in the rectory of St. Titus. She stated that Hopkins would, “*grab our face in his hands, force us to look up, and then plant a sloppy kiss on our mouths. He would also grab us and pull us close, wrap his cape around us, and fondle us wherever he pleased.*” She further stated that she remembered the dinners held on the weekend of forty hours, at which the girls at the convent were invited to serve. She only served one time. Whenever anyone would voice concern over Hopkins’s behavior, she would always hear the conduct dismissed by others as, “*Oh well, he’s old, he doesn’t mean anything by it.*” The victim told the Bishop that she knows that there is no excuse for such behavior nor is there any excuse for those who see it and do nothing about it.

On August 23, 1993, Trautman received a letter from the Office of Clergy Personnel. This letter stated that the office reviewed Hopkins’s file, which included sacramental records, applications of various pastoral positions, health-related correspondence, pictures, press releases including that of his death in 1957, and one letter of complaint. The letter of complaint contained in this file related to an incident in the 1920s that did not involve any sort of physical abuse or assault.

On January 11, 1994, the victim wrote another letter to Trautman. She enclosed a copy of the first letter and asked the Bishop to please respond. On January 24, 1994, Trautman wrote to the victim, acknowledging her recent letter about the accusation against Hopkins. The Bishop wrote that “*Since Monsignor Hopkins died in July of 1957, there is no possible way to investigate your accusation.*”

# Father Barry M. Hudock

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1969
YEAR OF DEATH:	Unknown
ORDINATION:	N/A

## Employment/Assignment History

8/01/1997 – N/A	Catholic University, Faculty, Washington, DC
-----------------	--

## Summary

Father Barry Hudock was a 27-year-old priest in 1996 when he engaged in inappropriate sexual conduct with a girl in her junior year of high school. Bishop Donald Trautman's notes detailed that the victim was a 17-year-old high school junior at Mercyhurst Preparatory when she was targeted by Hudock. This sexual abuse occurred in several different locations within the victim's local parish community, as well as in different states. In 1997, the Diocese of Erie assigned Hudock to The Catholic University in Washington, D.C. Prior to that appointment, Hudock, the victim, and another high school student traveled to Washington in the summer of 1997. Trautman documented that Hudock and the victim had engaged in kissing prior to the trip in the church rectory. He also wrote that a "major episode occurred" in a hotel room where the three stopped to stay for the night. Subpoenaed Diocesan records revealed that Hudock groped and kissed the victim on numerous occasions. It was also reported that Hudock showed the victim pornographic videos, undressed her in his rectory and sexually assaulted her.

In 2008, the victim was having a difficult time dealing with the psychological issues stemming from her victimization at the hands of Hudock. She had been seeing a professional counsellor in Texas when she contacted the Diocese of Erie. The Diocese agreed to pay for her medical bills and provided her with airfare to be seen by the team at St. Luke's Institute in Suitland, Maryland.

Trautman notified Hudock's then-employer, Christian Brother Academy, a Catholic Preparatory high school in Syracuse, New York. Hudock was working there as a teacher. Trautman also notified the Bishop of Syracuse and Hudock himself. Soon after this notification, the school terminated Hudock. Trautman also notified the Erie County District Attorney's Office. At that time, Hudock was no longer a priest, was living in the Syracuse area, and was married with 7 children.

Hudock's current employment status is unknown, but he operates his own religious website titled, "Faith Meets World" and has written several religious books for Liturgical Press under his given name, as well as under the pen name "Barry Michaels." On his webpage he lists his credentials in the "About" section. His service as a priest is not listed.

## Reverend Joseph W. Jerge

### Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1927
YEAR OF DEATH:	2006
ORDINATION:	May 3, 1951

### Employment/Assignment History

5/18/1951 – 6/30/1952	Parochial Vicar, St. Boniface, Erie, PA
6/30/1952 – 5/23/1959	Parochial Vicar, St. John the Baptist, Erie, PA
5/23/1959 – 8/29/1964	Parochial Vicars, St. Joseph, Oil City, PA
8/29/1964 – 6/03/1970	Pastor, St. Hippolyte, Guys Mills, PA
6/30/1970 – 12/04/1989	Pastor, St. Callistus, Kane, PA
4/19/1989 – 11/22/1989	Sick Leave
12/04/1989 – 6/14/1991	Parochial Vicar, St. John the Evangelist, Girard, PA
6/14/1991 – 9/01/1992	Parochial Vicar, St. Francis Xavier, McKean, PA
9/01/1992 – 2006	St. Patrick's Retirement Resident, Erie, PA

### Summary

The Diocese of Erie was first made aware of sexual abuse allegations against Joseph W. Jerge in early 1989. On April 19, 1989, he was sent to St. Luke's Institute for sexual psychological therapy. In the fall of 1989, he was released from St. Luke's and signed an aftercare contract that restricted his contact and ministry with young boys. He was placed back into ministry at St. John the Evangelist.

On April 10, 1991, Jerge had a meeting with several members of the clergy, including Father Fischer. In this meeting, the support team voiced their concerns about Jerge's violations of his post-care contract, specifically about his continued contact with young boys. As a result, Bishop Trautman re-assigned Jerge to St. Francis Xavier parish in McKean on June 14, 1991. At that time Fischer, wrote several letters to the administration at St. Luke's voicing his concerns that Jerge was failing in his efforts to stay away from the youth of the Diocese. In his letters, Fischer reported that Jerge had admittedly offended upon numerous children and was nevertheless coaching youth basketball, hearing confessions, and ministering at a parish that had a swimming pool. Fischer went on to write that he felt that this swimming pool "*will only nourish the sickness.*"

In that same month, June 1991, Jerge again agreed to adhere to the conditions set forth in his original post-treatment conditions that restricted his contact with the young men of his parish. This clergy meeting took place in the presence of Father Glenn Whitman, Director of Clergy Personnel, and Father John Kirk.

## Summary

Jerge's ministerial timeline places him at two parishes after the Diocese had officially confirmed the existence of several child victims of his sexual abuse and after he had been sent to St. Luke's for psychological counseling. It is unclear which victims came forward with allegations against Jerge, but one such victim is particularly well-documented by the Diocese. Victim #1 was a sophomore in high school when Jerge befriended him, took him on trips alone, and fondled him on a number of occasions. Later in Victim #1's life he would be blackballed from employment and preemptively blocked from any attempt to be admitted to seminary. In 1995, Victim #1 applied for a position as Director of Religious Education at one of the Diocesan schools. The Grand Jury found documentation in Diocese files that Bishop Trautman personally instructed school administrators not to hire Victim #1, noting in a letter to Father William Kuba that Victim #1 may be homosexual and may have attempted suicide. Also found in Victim #1's file was a notation that he was living an openly gay lifestyle and going to gay bars. This "File Update" marked Confidential is dated August 23, 1996. The same File Update which accuses Victim #1 of being homosexual concludes with this sentence: "This file update is provided in the event that [Victim #1] would seek admission to the seminary studies here in this Diocese or elsewhere." This clear evidence that Victim #1 had been blackballed from employment or admission to seminary is contrary to the compassionate image the Church has historically sought to portray. It is also noted that the Diocese paid at least \$1,200 of Victim #1's counselling fees.

Jerge's abuse of Victim #2 was documented in detail by the Diocese. Victim #2 stated that his sexual abuse by Jerge began in approximately 1981 to 1985, when he was between the ages of thirteen and eighteen at St. Callistus. Victim #2 stated that all sexual assaults by Jerge occurred inside Jerge's car. He stated that Father Jerge would invite a small group of altar boys to go out with him after finishing their tasks at church. Victim #2 stated that he and three to five other boys would accompany Jerge to a movie or to a restaurant for a meal. Victim #2 said that he was always the last boy in the car to be taken home by Jerge. He stated that Jerge would drive around in his car with him for approximately twenty to thirty minutes. Victim #2 stated that Jerge would place his hand on Victim #2's crotch area and caress and rub it. Victim #2 explained that Jerge would put his fingers between Victim #2's button fly and stimulate that area. Victim #2 estimated that Jerge would molest him in the manner described above approximately two to four times a month when he was between the ages of thirteen and eighteen.

Victim #2 reported that he remembered an incident when he was in high school where Jerge's name came up. Victim #2 advised that he was at a party with similar-aged friends and a small group of youths were playing a game of truth or dare. Victim #2 stated that during the game a female classmate asked Victim #2 "Truth or Dare? Has Father Jerge ever touched you? After this remark, Victim #2 wondered if others had also been sexually abused by Father Jerge.

Victim #2 eventually entered the priesthood and was ordained. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

## Summary

Victim #2 made his history of sexual abuse known to Bishop Donald Trautman in 2003. He obtained an attorney who sent a letter to Trautman notifying him of the allegations that had been made. A letter from Monsignor Robert J. Smith, Vicar General, on July 9, 2003 noted that there was a meeting between Trautman and Jerge. This letter stated that Trautman advised Jerge to consider securing both legal and canonical counsel. Trautman then advised Jerge that he intended to report Victim #2's allegations to the McKean County District Attorney. According to the letter, immediately following the meeting Trautman called the District Attorney for McKean County and gave her a full report of the allegations against Jerge. This letter also stated that Trautman called the District Attorney of Erie County to appraise him of the situation and to assure him of their compliance with the applicable standards and guidelines.

On August 10, 1992, while Jerge was the Parochial Vicar at St. Francis Xavier, a mother filed a complaint against Jerge. She accused Jerge of having an inappropriate friendship with her teenage son. The following day, several members of Trautman's administration met with Jerge. Monsignor Smith and Father Whitman concluded that the facts of the complaint, as they had been presented to the Diocese, were accurate and that Jerge did not deny them. As a result of this "grooming" behavior and in light of Jerge's history of child abuse, Trautman was forced to take Jerge out of ministry and place him in St. Patrick's Retirement Residence. Jerge spent the next fourteen years living in the Diocese's retirement facility, eventually dying in 2006.

# Father Stephen E. Jeselnick

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1951
YEAR OF DEATH:	N/A
ORDINATION:	May 20, 1977

## Employment/Assignment History

5/01/1976	Associate, Our Lady of the Americas, Conneaut, PA
6/03/1977	Granted full faculties of the Diocese of Erie
9/06/1977	Faculty, Venango Christian HIGH SCHOOL w/residence at Assumption of the Blessed Virgin Mary, Oil City, PA
2/09/1987	Requests new assignment/residence. Wanted campus ministry
6/23/1978	Associate, St. Brigid and Campus Minister, Allegheny College w/Father William Karg
1/12/1980	Requests to be assigned to Notre Dame, IN (Holy Cross)
6/19/1980	Associate, St. Michael, Greenville, PA
7/31/1980	Appointed Defender of the Bond/Advocate for the Tribunal
3/31/1981	Bishop Watson agrees/recommends to release to Notre Dame, IN
6/02/1981	Accepted into Graduate Candidate Program at Notre Dame
11/06/1982	Withdraws voluntarily from Holy Cross, IN (Novitiate)
12/03/1982	Permitted to minister in Denver, CO, for a six-month assignment by Bishop Murphy
12/10/1982	Accepted by Archbishop Casey, Denver, CO
12/18/1982	Assigned to St. Mary's, Littleton, CO
Spring 1983	Re-assigned to Shrine of St. Anne, Arvada, CO
3/18/1983	Requests to enter/serve as Military Chaplain
4/08/1983	Bishop Murphy approves appointment to Military
5/13/1983	Requests incardination into Diocese of Colorado Springs, CO
9/12/1985	Incardination denied; Requests Leave of Absence
10/10/1985	Colorado Springs withdraws their faculties
11/5/1985	Requests permission to enter Air Force to be Chaplain and Additional Leave of Absence
4/1/1986	Requests to enter Archdiocese of Military
8/11/1986	Residence at Ecclesia Center, Erie, PA
10/03/1986	Parochial Vicar, St. Catherine, DuBois, PA; Chaplain, DuBois Medical Center; and Father Brugger's weekend assistant at Sigel and Corsica, PA
4/21/1987	Archdiocese Military endorses for Active Duty
11/18/1996	Military Archdiocese to facilitate the change from active to

7/14/1997

5/01/2014

reserve; the following month the Military endorses for inactive reserve duty

Veterans Administration Hospital, Baltimore, MD

Faculties revoked

## Summary

Father Stephen E. Jeselnick began service in the Diocese of Erie in May 1977, and it is unclear when he officially retired.

A review of the Diocese's files on Jeselnick reflected no abuse of children under the age of 18 and therefore he was not reportable under the guidelines established by the Church in 2002. This "*Charter for the Protection of Young Children and Young People*" was established by the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops. Jeselnick's file only listed two known victims and both were over the age of legal adulthood.

The same cannot be said, however, for three of Jeselnick's victims who were not included in the Diocese's files. The Grand Jury heard in-person testimony from three members of a family who each testified to their abuse at the hands of Jeselnick. Their accounts of Jeselnick's abuse included genital fondling, oral, and anal sex. This occurred in the late 1970's when Jeselnick was stationed at St. Brigid in Meadville. All three men and several of their sisters testified that Jeselnick and a previously unidentified Deacon would come to their house and get intoxicated with their parents. Once the adults were sufficiently drunk, Jeselnick would find the boys, who were usually alone, and prey upon them. The three men testified that their mother worked for the parish and would sometimes take the boys to work with her. Jeselnick would sexually violate them both at home and on church grounds, and this abuse still haunts them to this day.

No record of this family's abuse were located in the Diocesan files because the abuse was never reported to the Diocese and these victims only came forward in 2017. When they did come forward, the Diocese directed them to the Crawford County District Attorney's Office. In early 2017, both the Diocese and its law firm had been notified that any and all incoming child sexual assault cases were to be referred to the attention of the Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General. However, it was only after a family member reached out to a local newspaper reporter that they were referred to the Office of Attorney General.

In 2014 the newly appointed Bishop of Erie, Lawrence Persico, received a letter from Jeselnick requesting a letter of suitability for ministry. After reviewing his file and doing an internet search, Persico denied Jeselnick's faculties as a priest and informed him that he will never again be granted permission to serve in public ministry.

# Reverend Thomas C. Kelley

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1943
YEAR OF DEATH:	2005
ORDINATION:	December 21, 1967

## Employment/Assignment History

7/25/1968 – 7/16/1972	Parochial Vicar, St. Peter Cathedral, Erie, PA
7/16/1972 – 3/17/1978	Special Ministry, St. Mark's Seminary, Erie, PA
7/16/1972 – 5/05/1979	Weekend Asst., Our Lady of Mercy, Harborcreek, PA
3/17/1979 – 5/05/1979	Special Ministry, St. Mark's Seminary, Erie, PA
5/05/1979 – 9/01/1985	Special Ministry, St. Mark's Seminary, Erie, PA
9/01/1985 – 6/30/1989	Dean, North American College, Rome, Italy
8/28/1989 – 3/27/1990	Administrator, St. Michael, Greenville, PA
3/27/1990 – 6/15/1994	Pastor, St. Michael, Greenville, PA
3/01/1992 – 6/15/1994	Diocesan Review Board
6/15/1994 – 12/31/1995	Leave of Absence, Odessa, TX/Erie, PA
9/18/1995 – 9/22/1995	Psychological Assessment, Southdown Treatment Center, Canada
4/1996 – 9/1996	Residential Treatment, Southdown Center, Aurora, Ontario, Canada
9/06/1994 – 12/31/1996	Pastor, St. Agnes, Ft. Stockton, TX
12/31/1995 – 3/31/1995	Chaplain, Holy Faith Monastery
3/31/1996 – 11/25/1996	Assigned to Diocese of San Angelo, TX
11/25/1996 – 1/01/2001	Incarnated into Diocese of San Angelo, TX
2/21/2005	Death

## Summary

Reverend Thomas C. Kelley served two different dioceses in two states, as well as in Europe, over the course of his 30 year career. He was accused of inappropriate sexual conduct with at least five victims and was named in a lawsuit that paid one sexual assault victim \$34,500. His victims of choice were eighteen to twenty-five-year-old males in high school or in seminary. Kelley engaged in mutual masturbation, oral, and anal sex with his victims.

Although the Diocesan records do not reflect which one of his victims' complaints prompted the Diocese to send him to psychotherapy, in the fall of 1995 Kelley was sent to the Southdown Center in Aurora, Ontario, Canada. Southdown is an inpatient residential treatment facility that specializes in treating men and women in ministry. Kelley was sent there for a week-long assessment period. Per this assessment, it was determined that Kelley should have a restricted ministry that kept him away from young parishioners. Kelley disagreed with this assessment and asked Bishop Trautman to send him to a different facility for a second opinion.

## Summary

A physician from DuBois, Pennsylvania saw Kelley in 1996 and in March of that year agreed with the course of action that Southdown recommended. Soon afterward, Kelley was sent to Southdown for several months of treatment. After his release, Kelley traveled to Odessa, Texas to take some time off and meet with an old friend with whom he attended seminary. He reported to Trautman that he had reflected on his conduct while in Odessa and decided that he was not ready to quit serving God. According to the documents, Kelley became interested in staying in active ministry in the West Texas area during this time period. Over the course of the next several years Kelley spent most of his time in the Diocese of San Angelo, Texas as a priest in that Diocese. It was found that Bishop Trautman had told Kelley that if he returned to the Erie Diocese, he would need to be assigned a severely restricted ministry. Faced with this harsh restriction, Kelley asked to be assigned full time in Texas by permission of Trautman and Bishop Michael Pfeifer of the Diocese of San Angelo. Both Bishops agreed to Kelley's request. In their correspondence, Trautman and Pfeifer often referenced telephone conversations they had about Kelley and his troubled past.

During his visits to Erie during this period, Kelley also had some interaction with a licensed social worker and therapist in the Erie area. She would confer with Trautman, Kelley, and Pfeifer on Kelley's treatment plan. She questioned Kelley's suitability to be a priest and, in an e-mail message to Trautman, she wrote, "*If Tom Kelley has in fact been a predator, I think it is time he is removed from the priesthood.*" In another e-mail she advised Trautman that, "*I think it is time to ensure that Tom Kelley (although in Texas) no longer abuses children.*" She also criticized Pfeifer, writing, "*it appears to me that he did not take responsibility to ensure the safety of those under his care.*"

Kelley passed away in February, 2005.

# Father Gary L. Ketcham

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1949
YEAR OF DEATH:	N/A
ORDINATION:	September 10, 1977

## Employment/Assignment History

9/10/1977 – 1/23/1984	St. Bonaventure University, Faculty Franciscan Friars, NY
5/1983–1/23/1984	St. Patrick's, Buffalo, NY
1/23/1984 – 9/11/1985	Parochial Vicar, St. John the Baptist, Erie, PA
9/11/1985 – 8/01/1989	Parochial Vicar, St. George, Erie, PA
3/05/1989 – 6/14/1989	Health Leave, Guest House, Rochester, MN
6/14/1989 – 6/08/1990	Health Leave, St. Luke's Institute, Suitland, MD
6/08/1990 – 7/16/1990	Health Leave, St. Patrick's/St. Hedwig Cluster, Erie, PA
11/13/1998 – 2004	Suspended/Other
2004– Present	Privately employed; not functioning as a Priest

## Summary

Sometime prior to March 1989, allegations of sexual misconduct by Father Gary L. Ketcham became known by the Diocese of Erie. He was accused of molesting two boys while in a drunken state. This occurred while he was visiting friends in Mobile, Alabama. Ketcham was officially charged with two counts of sexual abuse of minors in Baldwin County, Alabama, on February 2, 1990. He was sent to therapy as soon as the Diocese was made aware of the Alabama incident. He was housed in a Diocese-owned treatment facility, which they called the Ecclesia Center.

Diocesan preparation for Ketcham's court case started in September 1989, when the Diocese loaned Ketcham \$5,000 for attorney fees. Subpoenaed documents revealed that this was the first of a number of loans to Ketcham. Additionally, the Grand Jury found a promissory note to Ketcham from the Diocese in which they pledged to front him \$25,000 for lawyer fees and bond. In that letter, the Director of Clergy Personnel wrote "*Don't worry . . . you're good for it.*"

Ketcham ultimately pled guilty to both counts and was ordered to pay a \$15,000 fine. He received a permanent felony record.

In 2002, Bishop Trautman initiated the laicization process to formally remove Ketcham from the church. Ketcham cooperated with this process. Trautman would note that it was Ketcham's own free will that drove the process. Ketcham was officially laicized by 2004.

# Father Thaddeus Kondzielski

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1941
YEAR OF DEATH:	N/A
ORDINATION:	May 27, 1967

## Employment/Assignment History

6/16/1967-8/31/1986	Secondary Education, Cathedral Preparatory., Erie Facility
6/16/1967-6/03/1970	Weekend Asst., St. Stanislaus, Erie, PA
6/03/1970-8/31/1986	Weekend Asst., St. Hedwig, Erie, PA
8/31/1986-10/01/1988	Health Leave, Other
10/01/1988-6/30/1994	Administrator, St. Philip (Crossingville) Edinboro, PA
6/30/1994-5/04/2000	Pastor, St. Philip (Crossingville) Edinboro, PA
5/04/2000-6/29/2006	Pastor, St. Philip (Crossingville) Edinboro, PA (Reappointed 2 <sup>nd</sup> 6 yr. term)
6/30/2006-8/31/2012	Pastor, St. Philip (Crossingville) Edinboro, PA (Reassigned 3 <sup>rd</sup> 6 yr. term)
9/01/2012-4/28/2013	Pastor, St. Philip Crossingville) Edinboro, PA (Reappointed 4 <sup>th</sup> 6 Yr. term)
4/29/2013-	Retired

## Summary

Father Thaddeus Kondzielski was assigned as a teacher at Erie Cathedral Preparatory for 19 years. In January 2013, a victim contacted the Diocese to advise that 30 years earlier, when he was a sophomore at Cathedral Preparatory, Kondzielski would ask him to assist with grading papers in the rectory. On one occasion, Kondzielski asked him to stay and lift weights. When he said he did not have the proper clothes, Kondzielski suggested that they lift weights naked. They then proceeded to lift weights together while they were naked. When he told his parents about the naked weight lifting incident, they were shocked and told him to stay away from Kondzielski. When confronted with this allegations, Kondzielski claimed he did not remember the incident, but did not deny it because it could have happened. Kondzielski changed his version of lifting weights naked to him wearing a "*Speedo*" to lift weights.

The victim also reported, and Kondzielski admitted, that it was common practice for he and the students to swim naked in the school pool. Kondzielski stated that he did not think this was a big deal since the headmaster knew about it and never said anything about it. He did not admit to any physical contact with any of his students. He did admit, however, that students who helped him grade papers slept overnight in his bed.

**Summary**

The Grand Jury did not find any evidence that the Diocese of Erie notified law enforcement about Kondzielski's behavior.

# Father Gerard Krebs

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1938
YEAR OF DEATH:	2005
ORDINATION:	December 18, 1963

## Employment/Assignment History

7/26/1964 – 6/3/1970	Secondary Education Venango Christian High School, Oil City, PA
7/26/1964 – 6/3/1970	Weekend Assistant, St. Stephen's, Oil City, PA
6/3/1970 – 9/8/1970	Parochial Vicar, Our Lady Queen of the Americas, Conneaut Lake, PA
6/3/1970 – 9/8/1970	Resident, St. Stephen's Rectory, Oil City, PA
9/8/1970 – 12/6/1978	Parochial Vicar, Erie, St. John the Baptist
12/6/1978 – 1/27/1983	Pastor, Holy Cross Church, Brandy Camp, PA
1/27/1983 – 6/30/1990	Pastor, St. Patrick, Erie, PA
3/1/1990 – 5/4/1990	Health Leave, Guest House, Rochester, MN
6/30/1990 – 1/6/1992	Pastor, St. Patrick, Erie, PA
1/6/1992 – 12/31/2003	Director of RCIA, Diocesan Office, Erie, PA
1/6/1992 – 2/4/1994	Resident, Blessed Sacrament, Erie, PA
2/4/1994 – 3/27/2004	Resident, St. Joseph/Bread of Life, Erie, PA
4/10/1996 – 10/1/1996	Chaplain, Soldiers & Sailors Home
11/17/1996 – 5/8/1997	Weekend Assistant, St. Patrick, Erie, PA
11/22/1996 – 12/31/2003	Director of Activities/Coming Millennium, Diocesan Office, Erie, PA
1/1/04 – 5/25/2005	Retired, Priest Retirement Residence, Erie, PA

## Summary

Three known victims came forward indicating that they were sexually abused by Father Gerard Krebs. The first victim claimed in a March 19, 2002 e-mail communication to Bishop Donald Trautman that he was sexually abused by Krebs in 1968. At that time Krebs was an English teacher at Venango Christian High School ("VCHS"). Sometime around graduation, Victim #1 learned that he had impregnated his girlfriend. Distraught, he sought out Krebs for counseling and guidance. Krebs stated that he was once a pre-med student and in order to determine whether or not Victim was capable of impregnating a woman Krebs needed to check Victim #1's prostate. Krebs did so through penetration of Victim #1's anus with his finger.

A second victim alleged that Krebs sexually abused him sometime in the late 1960s at VCHS. In a letter to Father Tom Brown of St. Thomas the Apostle in Corry dated April 6, 2002, a woman stated that her brother was "*sexually molested*" by Krebs and that she had learned of

## Summary

it through conversation with her brother. She further alleged that Krebs was known to take the victim and other male students to different places and to give them wine.

The third victim stated in an October 20, 2006 e-mail that he attended VCHS from 1964 to 1968. Victim #3, who was Episcopalian, approached Krebs during his junior year about the possibility of becoming Catholic. Victim #3 alleged that Krebs led him through “*a series of sexual rituals to both prove my faith and the fact that I was not a homosexual.*” Moreover, Victim #3 referenced a 1969 graduate of VCHS who described numerous experiences of the same nature that he and other classmates endured but did not divulge any additional information.

In 2002, following these allegations, Krebs underwent psychological evaluation at St. Luke’s Institute in Silver Spring, Maryland. At this time, Krebs expressed acceptance of his homosexuality during his evaluations but stated he could not recall any specific instances in which he had sexually abused young boys. Krebs did, however, indicate that his drinking was so severe at that point in his life that he could not rule out the possibility of it having happened. Krebs did appear to recall Victim #2 and stated that they slept together in the same bed in a hotel room but had had no sexual contact.

The Grand Jury found no documentation indicating that law enforcement was ever notified about any of Krebs interactions with his victims.

# Father Jerry (John) Kucan

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1924
YEAR OF DEATH:	2010
ORDINATION:	June 24, 1951

## Employment/Assignment History

1952-1954	St. Anthony's, Sharon, PA
1954-1961	St. Joseph's, Bethlehem, PA
1961-1972	St. Mary's, Steelton, PA
1972-1973	Our Lady of Peace Friary, Beaver Falls, PA
1973-1977	St. Anthony's, Sharon, PA
1977-1978	Sacred Heart, Milwaukee, WI
1978-1979	Beaver Falls Friary, Beaver Falls, PA
1979-1982	St. Mary's, Steelton, PA
1982-1985	St. Jerome's, Chicago, IL
1985-1986	Sacred Heart, Milwaukee, WI
1986-1988	St. Anthony's, Chicago, IL
1988-1994	At. Augustine's, West Allis, WI
1994-1995	Sacred Heart, Chicago, IL
1995-2005	St. Anthony's Friary, Chicago, IL

## Summary

In February of 2005, a thirty-nine-year-old man wrote a letter to the Diocese of Erie in which he stated that he had attended St. Anthony's School in Sharon, Pennsylvania and that in 1974 he began serving midnight mass. Victim #1 stated that "Father Jerry" began an inappropriate relationship with him at that time. Victim #1 wrote that Father Jerry gave him a St. Christopher necklace as a gift and soon afterward the inappropriate behavior began. The letter said that Kucan instructed Victim #1 to serve morning mass before school, at which time the behavior continued. Victim #1 wrote that he would be called out of class at times, where he would meet with Father Jerry and a Brother who wore a brown robe. These "meetings" would take place in a room on the second floor of the gym. The letter explained that Kucan told Victim #1 that if he ever told anyone about their relationship, Victim #1's mother would lose her job in the school kitchen and he would be kicked out of school. Victim #1 wrote in the letter that he would go to confession weekly to confess his sins and that Kucan would tell him that the slate was wiped clean. Victim #1 stated in his letter that he was now having trouble dealing with many issues such as trust, intimacy, and questioning of his sexual orientation. Victim #1 asked if the Diocese had an assistance program available for those suffering from such emotional difficulties.

## Summary

In March of 2005, Bishop Donald Trautman wrote back to Victim #1. The Bishop stated that St. Anthony's Croatian Catholic Church in Sharon was staffed by Croatian Franciscan priests at the time in question and that "Father Jerry" could have been Father Jerry Kucan. The Bishop stated that after he received Victim #1's letter, he called and spoke to Father Marko Puljic of the Croatian Franciscan Custody of the Holy Family of the United States and Canada. The Bishop said that he read Victim #1's letter to Puljic and that he asked Puljic to call Victim #1. The Bishop stated that he was sending Victim #1's letter, along with the Bishop's return letter, to Puljic. The Bishop then stated that Kucan was not a priest of the Erie Diocese and the resolution of the matter rested with the Croatian Franciscans. The Bishop then wrote that Victim #1 should contact Catholic Charities in Dallas, where he lived at the time, to help with his emotional difficulties. The Bishop included a phone number for the Director of that office.

In June of 2005, Father Puljic received a letter from Attorney Richard Serbin of the Law Firm Serbin, Kovacs & Nypaver of Altoona, PA. The letter advised Puljic that the firm had been retained by Victim #1 on this matter and described Kucan's "inappropriate behavior" in detail. This letter stated that Victim #1 was eight years old when he met Kucan and that Kucan thereafter molested the boy on a regular basis. This letter stated that Kucan would take Victim #1 to the second floor of the gym, where Kucan would perform oral sex on the eight year old. The letter also alleged that Kucan would have a brother in a brown robe present on some occasions and that this brother would also perform oral sex on Victim #1. The letter stated that Victim #1 was currently undergoing counseling.

The letter concluded with Attorney Serbin stating that he had represented individuals that had been victims of clergy abuse for eighteen years. He stated that it was his policy to "*attempt amicable resolution of all claims on behalf of my clients prior to filing suit. I have been able to achieve settlements on behalf of abuse victims with multiple Dioceses and religious communities. I have found that when there is a sincere desire on the part of the church leaders to correct wrongs of the past, recognition of the long term effects of clergy abuse upon victims, and reasonableness on part of all parties, that these cases can be resolved without resorting to the courts. It is my sincere hope that the Croatian Franciscans will accept responsibility for Father Jerry Kucan, and do the right thing by [Victim #1] in fairly compensating him for the horrible injuries that he has suffered as a result of his abuse.*" It appears as though Victim #1 did attend counseling at the Catholic Charities in Dallas, which was set up by the Diocese of Erie. In 2016, Victim #1 wrote to the Erie Diocese seeking to obtain counseling/progress notes that his Dallas counselor had provided to the Erie Diocese.

On January 8, 2007, Vicar General, Monsignor Robert J. Smith received a letter from a woman who stated that her husband had been molested by a priest in the mid 1950's when he served as an altar boy at St. Anthony's on Idaho Street in Sharon. The letter stated that her husband's cousins were also victims. This writer stated in the letter that her husband committed suicide in 1993 after a long struggle with depression. She had spoken to her husband's therapist after his death and the therapist told her that her husband's severe depression was a direct result of being molested at St. Anthony's as a child. The writer stated that she has heard that other men who were molested at St. Anthony's had committed suicide. She stated that she knew that the offending priest was now dead, but that the Catholic Church was not excused for the abuse. She

## Summary

concluded her letter by asking Monsignor Smith how she could see any other reports on cases similar to this.

On January 16, 2007, Monsignor Smith responded. In his letter, Monsignor Smith writes that he was very sorry to hear about the molestation of the writer's husband as a young boy in the 1950s and his subsequent suicide in 1993. The letter then stated that Monsignor Smith was not aware of the priest who may have committed the crime against her husband. The letter stated that St. Anthony's was staffed by priests from the Croatian Franciscan Custody of the Holy Family and that the priest who abused her husband most probably was from that order. The letter contained the name and address of Father Marko Puljic for her to contact.

The letter then addresses apparent requests made by the writer. Smith wrote "*Regarding your request for reports of other like incidents in the parish, two others have come to our attention over the years. The first involved a Croatian Franciscan assigned to the parish in the early 70s. The report came to us in February 2005. The Diocese notified the Croatian Provincial on March 1<sup>st</sup>, got back to the individual several days later and offered him counseling assistance. The second incident involved another Croatian Franciscan. It allegedly happened in the mid 80's. One of our Episcopal Vicars serving in the Western Vicariate was made aware of it, reported it to then Bishop Michael Murphy and the priest was removed immediately from the ministry.*" Smith was contacted by a social service agency in Florida after this second Croatian Franciscan had applied for a secular position there. Smith called the Director and advised them that a complaint of abuse had been filed against the individual, that he had been removed from the ministry when it was reported, and that he had left the religious order. The letter concluded with this paragraph: "*Bishop Trautman has been our bishop since 1990. He has been vigilant and aggressive in dealing with this tragic issue. Sexual abuse is abhorrent to all of us and when committed by a trusted member of the church, doubly so.*"

A file-note contained within the files claimed that on January 25, 2007, Bishop Trautman notified Attorney Frank Kroto about the recent complaint from Victim #1, as well as a complaint from another man. The file note states that Bishop Trautman asked Attorney Kroto to inform District Attorney Bradley Foulk of the complaints, the identity of the priests, and the names of the alleged victims. Kroto was also asked to assure the DA that the Diocese would comply with any requests for additional facts and information.

A file note showed that on July 31, 2007, Vicar General Smith wrote that he spoke with Father Marko Puljic to get an update on Kucan and to determine when he was removed from the ministry. Puljic said that Father Kucan was taken out of the ministry in March 2005, when the Order received its first complaint against him. The Order settled with Victim #1 filing the complaint. The file note also indicated that Kucan was then in his mid- eighties and in the early stages of dementia.

There is nothing contained in this file that shows that any actual correspondence between the Church and the District Attorney occurred.

# Monsignor Louis Lorei

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1921
YEAR OF DEATH:	1986
ORDINATION:	N/A

## Employment/Assignment History

9/1981 – 9/1985	Pastor, Our Lady of Peace, Erie, PA
Unknown	Possibly Gannon University

## Summary

In December 2009, Father Mark Hoffman called the Bishop's office to report an allegation involving child sexual abuse by Monsignor Louis Lorei. The parents of a boy had approached him to report that their son stated he "*was touched by Monsignor Lorei*" in the early 1980's. Bishop Trautman later met with the victim. The victim stated that about 1980 or 1981, he was a student, roughly age 11 to 13, at Our Lady of Peace school. He was also an altar server during early mass with Lorei. On one occasion, Lorei invited him into the rectory and into his bedroom. Lorei had the victim sit on the bed while Lorei sat next to him and hugged and kissed him on the lips. This would occur several days in a row, stop, and then begin again. The victim eventually refused to serve mass with Lorei. Lorei was soon removed by then-Bishop Murphy. In his own handwritten words, Trautman expressed the personal belief that Lorei's sudden departure may likely have been indicative of some kind of significant event. Trautman offered the victim counseling services. Financial assistance was also discussed.

In a memorandum dated March 30, 2007, Hoffman also documented an additional victim of Lorei. Hoffman found out through the father of the second victim that his son was allegedly abused by Lorei. The victim reportedly described the incident during a United Methodist retreat in 2000.

A small note in the file states "*Review Board found no merit in processing since supposed victim did not come forth even after requests.*" It is unclear as to whom that note refers.

Despite a grand jury subpoena, no file for Monsignor Louis Lorei was made available by the Erie Diocese. A public records database search listed one additional, potential address associated with Lorei in Erie, which appears to be the address of Gannon University.

# Father Salvatore P. Luzzi

## Biographical Information

DATE OF BIRTH:	1935
YEAR OF DEATH:	
ORDINATION:	May 31, 1962

## Employment/Assignment History

6/09/1962 – 8/29/1968	Faculty, Venango Christian High. Residence at St. Joseph, Oil City, PA
8/28/1968 – 8/28/1969	Sp. Ministry, St. Mark's Seminary, Erie, PA
8/28/1968 – 7/16/1972	Dean/Collegians, St. Mark's Seminary, Erie, PA
7/16/1972 – 5/05/1979	Sp. Ministry, St. Mark's Seminary, Erie, PA
5/05/1979 – 7/19/1994	Pastor, St. Joseph, Warren, PA
3/19/1991 – 8/01/1994	Sp. Ministry, Dean/Warren Co. Deanery, St Joseph, Warren, PA
7/19/1994 – 2/10/1995	Sick Leave
5/05/1979 – 9/15/1995	Resided at St. Joseph
9/15/1995 - currently	Faculties removed

## Summary

After several years teaching at Venango Christian High School, Reverend Salvatore P. Luzzi was moved to St. Mark's Seminary, where he filled several roles. Over the course of his 30 year ministry, he was accused of sexual misconduct by eight male victims ranging in age from early teens to early twenties. Some of these victims were groped, inappropriately kissed, hugged, and/or fondled. He also faced allegations of responsibility for the suicide of a former student/victim.

Luzzi worked extensively with young would-be priests at St. Mark's where he and fellow priest Leon Muroski served as Spiritual Directors to the seminarians. Luzzi's inappropriate touching and fondling of at least two seminarians prompted the Diocese to settle with those seminarians for large sums of money. The first former Seminarian's case was settled in civil court for \$34,500 and this individual received several thousand dollars over the course of the many years that the Diocese paid for his counseling and medication costs.

Several other former juvenile victims of Luzzi received letters or phone calls of apology from the Diocese. These victims were counseled by the Diocese through correspondence or in-person interviews wherein Luzzi's behavior was dismissed as "*Sal's way of expressing himself*" and his "*touching approach*" to ministry was attributed to his Italian upbringing.

The Diocese listed several Luzzi victims in its internal reports, but little to no documentation was contained in the files. It was alleged that Luzzi groped the buttocks of one

## Summary

victim in a hardware store in 1998. This individual was 19 at the time of the incident. Luzzi denied the touching and only admitted to patting this individual on the back.

In 1974-1975, Luzzi and Father Leon Muroski were working at Camp Notre Dame in Fairview when a young seminarian named Michael Amy was accused of fondling two juveniles. These victims reported the incident to the Pennsylvania State Police, the Diocese of Erie, and to their parents. The Diocese representative for this incident at Camp Notre Dame was Father Lawrence Speice. Speice assisted Amy by interceding on Amy's behalf with the State Police and the boys' parents. No arrest was made. Luzzi and Muroski dealt with Amy by making him attend counselling and keeping him in seminary. Amy would go on to abuse at least two more juveniles, along with several other unidentified juvenile prostitutes as an ordained priest prior to being laicized.

During Amy's laicization process, he called Speice, Muroski and Luzzi as his witnesses. Muroski denied knowledge of any wrongdoings by Amy. Speice and Luzzi both admitted some knowledge of Amy's molestation of children in 1974-1975. Luzzi wrote on Amy's Witness Statement that he was "*amazed that he was made a pastor in a place where something happened before,*" and that "*there certainly should have been something in his Seminary day files.*" Luzzi added, "*I personally wondered when these things would resurface.*"

In 1994, Bishop Trautman sent both Luzzi and Muroski to St. Luke's Institute for therapy. The Diocese publicly announced that Luzzi was going on an extended sabbatical for "*personal, spiritual and academic growth.*" Once Luzzi was discharged, the Bishop welcomed him back into pastoral ministry by letter on February 14, 1995. However, the welcome also came with several conditions and a Penial Precept, a formal notification in the church that restricts ministry. Trautman directed Luzzi to refrain from all contact with youth under 19 years of age and to avoid travel and social interaction with such parishioners. Later that same year, in September 1995, Trautman had Luzzi's faculties as a priest removed and Luzzi began residing in a private residence, where he remains today.

It was Luzzi's position that Trautman forced him to retire. It was the position of Trautman and the Diocese that what led to Luzzi's resignation was the weight of new allegations and the real possibility of widespread publicity. It was found in subpoenaed files that Luzzi's accusers threatened to take "*appropriate steps*" if Luzzi was not removed from ministry. This information was found in an internal document written by Monsignor Robert Smith and placed into Luzzi's file on October 12, 1995. Smith and Trautman informed Luzzi that if he did not retire of his own free will, the Diocese would follow the canonical process specified in church law to remove Luzzi. Luzzi resigned less than 30 days later.

# Father Richard D. Lynch

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1937
YEAR OF DEATH:	2000
ORDINATION:	May 5, 1963

## Employment/Assignment History

6/01/1963 - 5/26/1972	Secondary Education Bradford Central Christian High School, Bradford, PA
5/26/1972 - 2/18/1983	Headmaster, Secondary Education Bradford Central Christian High School, Bradford, PA
2/18/1983 - 8/30/1999	Pastor, Erie Holy Rosary, Erie, PA
1984-1994	Dean, East Erie Deanery, Erie, PA
8/31/1999 – Death	Pastor, St. Mark's the Evangelist, Erie, PA

## Summary

A memorandum located in the files from the Diocese of Erie - - apparently written by a secretary to Bishop Trautman - - stated that an individual called on July 26, 2004 and stated that he had called one month earlier and had spoken to a priest because the Bishop was unavailable on the subject of “*sexual involvement years ago.*” This caller stated that the priest told him that he would be contacted but nobody had returned his call to date. The caller also said that he was very upset about what had recently been written in the USA Today newspaper about an Erie Benedictine nun and that he had cut the article out and sent it to Cardinal Rigali.

In the Diocesan files the Grand Jury found a handwritten note that was titled with the above caller's name. The page appears to be a hand written notes from an interview with the caller/Victim #1. The Grand Jury read the notes to indicate the following:

*[The victim] attended school and was a senior in 1978. He worked after hours at school and while he was cleaning the locker room, Father Richard Lynch touched him in a private area and later also pushed him against the wall. Another Father told Lynch not to touch [the victim].*

On an undated official document from the Office of the Bishop, handwritten in ink, the writer states that Victim #1 came to see Monsignor Smith and Bishop Trautman regarding incidents of supposed abusive and aggressive behavior by Father Richard Lynch, the former Headmaster of the Bradford Central Christian High School. The document further states, “[Victim 1] claims Lynch slammed him into the wall and this resulted in a trauma for [Victim #1]. Father Grady had Lynch removed and Father Welter then came as Headmaster. (All of this transpired before I came to the Diocese)”. Victim #1 claimed he went to the doctor in April of 1979 and had to have back surgery at the Erie Metro Health Center. The note then states that

## Summary

*“There are psychological issues present in [Victim #1], He receives money from Social Security because of DISABILITY”* At the bottom of the document, the writer writes that Victim #1 is agitated, but that *“he usually calms down as you talk with him.”* There was also a form titled *“Advisory Statement for Report of Sexual Misconduct”* in the file, which was dated August 11, 2004 and signed by Victim #1. This form advises the signee that they have the right to report alleged sexual misconduct directly to the Office of District Attorney, that they have the right to seek an Attorney of their choice, and lastly that the Church representative would not give them legal advice.

On July 2, 2014, a letter was sent to Victim #1 from Father Gramata, who oversees the St. Bernard of Clairvaux Cemetery advising Victim #1 that he was in violation of several regulations regarding his parents burial plot in the cemetery and that he had fifteen days to resolve the violations. On September 06, 2014, Father Gramata sent a letter to Bishop Persico advising him that the Cemetery removed the items in violation at Victim #1’s parents’ plot and had them stored. In May of 2015, Father Gramata wrote a letter to Persico and included a letter that Gramata had received from Victim #1, who was incarcerated at this time in the Albion State Correctional Institution and was angry at the removal of the gravesite items.

Another letter sent to Gramata by Victim #1 in September of 2015 was forwarded to Bishop Persico. In this letter, Victim #1 again went on at length about his displeasure with the cemetery. He stated in this letter *“I didn’t fight the Church back in ‘79 when things happened to me in the high school.”*

Victim #1 sent letters to Bishop Persico from March through September of 2016. He was writing letters to the Bishop because he was very upset over treatment that he was receiving from two Catholic Deacons inside Albion Prison. Victim #1 did not think the Deacons were being fair or sufficiently nice to him.

In a letter dated June 3, 2016, Victim #1 stated that he wanted to write the Bishop to get some things off his chest. He alleged that Father Richard Lynch was responsible for the sexual abuse that he went through while attending Bradford Central Catholic Christian High School 1978-1979. Victim #1 stated that he told Bishop Trautman about some physical abuse but was too ashamed to talk about the sexual abuse. There is a hand written notation in black ink on top of the letter that said, *“Reported to District Attorney Daneri 7-28-2016”*

There is also a memorandum in the file, dated August 5, 2016 from Deacon DeCecco to Smith that states that DeCecco had not met with Victim #1 about any abuse issues before that date. It goes on to say that DeCecco met with Victim #1 for forty five minutes and he mostly wanted to talk about how poorly the Church is being administered. Victim #1 did say that he was abused by Lynch while a student at Bradford Central and also that Trautman was aware of it. The memorandum stated that Victim #1 was offered counseling from Trautman at the time and had turned it down, but that he would accept it now if offered.

Victim #1 said that he had told others that he had never been abused, but that was because he was ashamed and afraid to speak about it back then. Victim #1 also told Deacon DeCecco

## Summary

that he believed it was wrong to take money from God's House and that he would therefore not seek compensation.

On August 15, 2016, Victim #1 wrote another letter to Persico and stated that he had a talk with DeCecco in the prison and discussed with him some of his concerns. Victim #1 went on to say that the main issue that concerned him was what happened to him at the Bradford Catholic High School. Victim #1 then wrote, "*I want you to consider making me an offer Monetary to end this with me and get me some counseling. The Priest that did this is gone now but it will always be with me.*" Victim #1 also referred to an incident in Altoona and reported that Bishop Barcheck now has a death on his shoulders. He wrote "*I would sign off on a check for \$20,000 to just close the books on this era. I'm trying to keep it quiet so this case never becomes public.*" Victim #1 told the Bishop that he could just send the \$20,000 check to him at Camp Hill.

On September 6, 2016, Persico wrote back to Victim #1 and told him that he was very sorry to hear of his claim of sexual abuse and apologized. The letter went on to state,

*Since Father Lynch is dead, the Diocese of Erie has nothing in its file regarding him sexually abusing students. This claim was never reported to the Diocese of Erie. I want you to know that I called the Erie County District Attorney's Office on July 25, 2016 to report the alleged sexual abuse. Also Child line was called on August 23, 2016 and the alleged abuse was reported to them. We want to help you in your healing process by offering counseling. The Diocese of Erie has a policy not to make monetary settlements. We are more concerned in the healing of victim survivors than by keeping the sexual abuse quiet. We need to know how the Diocese can assist in providing counseling while you are a resident of SCI Albion. Please let me know."*

Victim #1 responded to Persico's letter on September 12, 2016. In his letter to the Bishop, Victim #1 asked the Bishop why he did not notify McKean County, where the abuse occurred. Victim #1 also told the Bishop to ask Smith why he or retired Bishop Trautman never reported it, since he came up there and met with both of them.

Victim #1 then said that the Bishop could check with DeCecco and he could help with setting up counseling for him in Albion. Victim #1 then said that what the Bishop could do for him is to help the Catholic parish of St. Bernard's in Bradford make the goal of refurbishing the Church and have the Diocese donate on Victim #1's behalf to the building fund.

There were no further allegations contained in this particular file from other persons against Father Lynch. Lynch died prior to the allegations being reported to the District Attorney's Office.

# Monsignor Daniel Martin

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1917
YEAR OF DEATH:	2006
ORDINATION:	November 17, 1943

## Employment/Assignment History

1943 – 1945	Parochial Vicar, Sacred Heart, Sharon, PA
1945 – 1962	Faculty, Erie Cathedral Preparatory High School, Erie, PA
1948 – 1962	Assistant Headmaster, Erie Cathedral Preparatory, Erie, PA
1950 – 1962	Chaplain, Mercyhurst College
1962 – 1970	Pastor, St. Boniface, Kersey, PA
1962 – 1970	Headmaster, Elk Co. Christian High School, St. Mary's, PA
1970 – 1974	Pastor, St. Joseph, Oil City, PA
1974 – 1986	Pastor, St. George, Erie, PA
1984	Prelate of Honor, titled Monsignor
1986 – 1987	Retired, Residence at Mt. Calvary, Erie, PA
1987	Chaplain, Mercyhurst College for Religious women
2003	Blessed Sacrament, Residence

## Summary

Monsignor Daniel Martin was a priest in the Diocese of Erie for 43-three years who faced two known allegations of sexual abuse. The Grand Jury's review of his files found very little documented evidence of his abuse of a teenager who was an altar server in his parish. That victim would go on to become a priest himself and appeared in front of the Grand Jury to tell his story. Martin's second victim was a Seminarian who named Martin, along with Bishop Trautman and Fathers Salvatore Luzzi, Leon Muroski and Thomas Kelley, in a civil suit that was settled by the Diocese for \$34,500 on October 3, 1995. This Victim (Victim #2) claimed to have been sexually harassed and assaulted by the priests named in his suit.

Victim #2's abuse occurred at St. Mark's Seminary in Erie, amidst what he described as a '*culture of sexuality*' among the priests. He reported to the Diocese that the priests in the seminary have a '*fierce competition*' among themselves to sexually prey upon kids who had absentee fathers or children who had poor relationships with their fathers. Victim #2 explained that in the Seminary, the priests who acted as spiritual advisors to the seminarians would engage them in sexual misconduct. He reported that one of his spiritual counsellors, Gene Humenay, was upset when he learned that this type of sexual behavior was going on in the seminary, but Humenay did nothing to stop the abuse. Victim #2 believed the Diocese knew that the priests were sexually abusing the seminarians but did nothing about it. In his lawsuit, he named Bishop Donald Trautman, not as an abuser but as an enabler.

## Summary

Gene Humenay was subpoenaed into the Grand Jury to answer question regarding his knowledge of clergy sex assault. He had left the priesthood in 1987 to get married.

One of Victim #2's demands of the Diocese when he sued was to have all the priests named in his suit removed from ministry and given professional counselling. The Diocesan records did not specify if Martin was sent for treatment, but it was acknowledged in a letter to Victim #2 from the Diocese that Martin was seen at St. Luke's Institute in September 1995. This information cannot be corroborated by the documents provided to the Grand Jury.

This investigation found a document dated July 24, 1994 and labeled "*confidential memorandum for the file, RE: Daniel Martin.*" It documents the interaction between Bishop Trautman, Victim #2, and Daniel Martin. It records Trautman confronting Martin about the allegations of the sexual abuse of Victim #2. In it, Trautman wrote that Martin offered to donate \$3,500 towards Victim #2 receiving proper therapy. Martin also apologized to Trautman for the incident. Trautman accepted Martin's check and forwarded it on to Victim #2.

The first aforementioned accusation of sexual abuse against Martin was much less well-documented in the Diocese records and only came to light via the cooperation of another victim. Victim #1 contacted the Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General's Catholic Church Hotline to report his story. Victim #1 is also an ordained Catholic priest and has served the Diocese of Erie for many years. He was subpoenaed into the Grand Jury to tell his story. Victim #1 testified that Martin was his parish pastor and a role model for him because he had a dysfunctional family and he felt isolated from his friends. He explained that he felt the church and Martin became his '*surrogate family*'. This gave him access to all parts of the rectory. Victim #1 reported that when he would be upset over the troubles of his life, he would seek Martin's counsel. It is in these moments of weakness and vulnerability that predators look to exploit their victims, and Martin was no different. Victim #1 testified that Martin sexually fondled him on at least sixteen occasions between the ages of sixteen and nineteen. Victim #1 reported to this investigation that Martin abused him three times at St. George, eight times at Mt. Calvary and five times at Mercyhurst College.

Victim #1 testified that Martin was friends with several other priests that were known pedophiles. He said that on a number of occasions, Martin's friend, Father Gary Ketcham (see Father. Gary Ketcham narrative), invited him to play racquetball or took him to nice dinners. When he did play racquetball with Ketcham, he would always be instructed to bring a towel because Ketcham would insist on taking a shower with Victim #1 and the other boys he took to the racquetball court. Another known pedophile priest with whom Martin would often associate was Father Robert Hannon (see Rev. Robert Hannon narrative). Victim #1 testified that Hannon retired early and relocated to Hawaii. Victim #1 reported that Hannon retired early due to inappropriate behavior with children and he would often return to the Erie area to visit with Martin. Victim #1 told the Grand Jury that Hannon's way of befriending the altar boys was to hand out cash. Victim #1 testified that he personally experienced Hannon handing out money. He said Hannon would call it "green" and give it to any boy working the rectory. He added that Hannon and Martin were old friends from when they both worked in Oil City.

## **Summary**

Victim #1 went on to report that from his personal experience he did not see the problems in the Catholic Church to be one of clergy sex abuse or an issue of gay men. He testified that the real issue is that of power and the ability to force your will over those under you. He informed this investigation that he believes that the Diocese knew full well what Martin was and that he had been preying upon Victim #1 for some time. He said the rumors of his abuse at the hands of Martin were openly talked about with his spiritual advisors while he was in the seminary in 1989-1990.

A review of the subpoenaed files supplied to the Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General found little to no mention of Martin's molestation of Victim #1. What can be determined is that approximately the same time Victim #1 was in seminary openly decrying Martin's conduct, the Diocese had Martin assigned to Mercyhurst College. The Diocese would later restrict Martin's ministry at the college to dealings only with the Catholic nuns at the school.



## Summary

On December 4, 1988 a meeting was held between the Diocese and a parishioner who had recently changed parishes. Among other things, the report documented that the parishioner switched parishes partially due to "*sexual improprieties involving two of [her] children.*" One of these involved counseling sessions with [REDACTED] in which he repeatedly asked one of her children sexually-oriented questions and that this continued even after he had been advised to stop. The second involved another child who claimed that [REDACTED] had placed his hand on the boy's crotch.

Further, at the time of the meeting, the [REDACTED] from the same parish advised that her own children told her about other boys in the seventh and eighth grades who were taken by [REDACTED] to the rectory where he "*check[ed] them for testicular/prostate cancer.*" She further advised that she remembered these children returning to the classrooms "*acting kind of sheepish*" and that she was so concerned that she also switched parishes so that her children would not be involved.

Handwritten notes that appear to have been generated by Diocese personnel during the December 4, 1988 meeting described the above and a follow-up meeting with [REDACTED] on December 20, 1988. Among other things, the notes appear to state that [REDACTED] had made sexually explicit comments to the boy described above, whom he was counseling, on at least three separate occasions and that the boy's father removed the boy from any further counseling unless he or the boy's mother were present. The notes further appear to state that [REDACTED] had called the boy on at least one occasion to tell him that if he was planning to run away, he could stay with [REDACTED] at the rectory.

On January 1, 1991 a memorandum sent from [REDACTED] to Bishop Trautman with documentation of the December 1988 meeting described the above. Among other things, [REDACTED] advised Trautman that he has known [REDACTED] all his priesthood and the original complainant all her life. He stated he met with her and her husband about her complaints and that she retracted her statement about [REDACTED] placing his hand on her son's crotch.

The memo further advised that [REDACTED] was "*morally certain that there was no cause to believe any inappropriate advice or sexual abuse took place in either case.*" [REDACTED] then stated that it must be remembered most of the complainant's children were adopted or foster children and most have a handicap of some type. [REDACTED] advised that he did not ever contact [REDACTED] since he "*did not feel there was any need to take this any further.*"

[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]

## Reverend Leon T. Muroski

### Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1934
YEAR OF DEATH:	
ORDINATION:	May 26, 1960

### Employment/Assignment History

6/11/1960 – 9/01/1967	Parochial Vicar, St. Luke, Erie, PA
3/30/1961 – N/A	Chaplain, Erie County T.B. Hospital
9/01/1960 – 6/16/1967	Special Ministry, Faculty, St. Mark's, Erie, PA
6/16/1967 – 10/12/1982	Diocese Office, St. Mark's Seminary, Erie, PA
10/12/1982 – 9/01/1995	Pastor, Our Lady of the Lake, Edinboro, PA
5/1994	Sent to St. Luke's Institute for Psychological Treatment
9/01/1995 – 6/01/1997	Retired, St. Casimirs, Rectory, Erie, PA
6/01/1997 – 4/01/2001	The Christophers, Unknown duties, New York, NY,
5/03/2001	Resident, St. Patrick's, Erie, PA
9/01/2001 – 3/11/2002	Chaplain, Pleasant Ridge Manor West, Girard, PA
1/2320/03 – N/A	St. Patrick's, Unassigned
12/10/2015 – Present	Diocese Retirement Home, Erie, PA

### Summary

Father Leon Muroski served the Diocese of Erie from 1960 through 2002. Most of his ministry was spent serving in Special Ministry as an Administrator for the Diocese and working with young people aspiring to become priests at St. Mark's Seminary. After 20 years of administrative duties, Muroski finally got his own parish. This ministry lasted from 1982 until 1995, but was abruptly halted when in the early 1990s Muroski was accused of sexual misconduct while he was a Spiritual Director at the seminary. Muroski was sent to St. Luke's Institute in Suitland, Maryland, for individual psychotherapy in 1994 after he admitted to inappropriate contact with the seminarians under his watch. These seminarians were all male, eighteen to twenty-three years old, when Muroski would counsel them. This counselling included allegations of full body massages, kissing, masturbation and fondling of the seminarians' buttocks and genitals. Muroski would eventually be placed back into ministry after therapy at St. Luke's and served in the Diocese of Erie and in The Christophers program in New York City.

While some of these seminarians were not legally juveniles at the time of their abuse, at least three of them were under Muroski's tutelage. At this time Muroski and his fellow priest,

## Summary

Salvatore Luzzi (who also faced sexual misconduct allegations and was sent to SLI with Muroski), were assigned as Spiritual Directors to these seminarians.

In 1974-1975, Muroski and Luzzi were working at Camp Notre Dame in Fairview, Pennsylvania, when a young seminarian named Michael Amy (see Amy's narrative) was accused of fondling two juveniles. These victims reported the incident to the Pennsylvania State Police, the Diocese of Erie Administration, and to their parents. The Diocese representative for this incident and Camp Notre Dame was Father. Lawrence Speice. Speice assisted Amy by interceding on Amy's behalf with the State Police and the boy's parents. No arrest was made and the Diocese does not have a file on the victims. Muroski and Luzzi dealt with Amy by directing him to go to counselling and keeping him in seminary. Amy would go on to abuse at least two more juveniles as an ordained priest, along with several other undocumented juvenile prostitutes before being laicized.

During Amy's laicization process, he would call Speice, Muroski and Luzzi as his witnesses. Muroski denied knowledge of any wrongdoings by Amy. Speice and Luzzi both admitted some knowledge of Amy's molestation of children in 1974-1975.

The sexual abuse of seminarians by Muroski and Luzzi cost the Diocese of Erie over \$89,500.00 in civil payments to three former college seminarians were overseen by Muroski and Luzzi while they studied at St. Mark's. Another former seminarian had several thousand dollars of counselling paid for by the Diocese over the course of many years.

Soon after Muroski finished his therapy at St. Luke's, Bishop Trautman welcomed him back to pastoral ministry on February 22, 1995. This ministry came with several restrictions. Trautman restricted Muroski from contact with youth under the age of 19. In particular, Trautman specified restrictions on counselling, travelling, marriage preparation, recreation and socialization. This was ordered by penal precept dated the same date as Muroski's welcome back letter.

Little was found on Muroski's whereabouts or duties within the Diocese in 1995-1996, but in 1997, it was found that Muroski was serving in ministry for The Christophers in New York City. Once again, little is documented about his duties with The Christophers and it is unknown if The Christophers were notified of his past sexual involvement with young people in Erie.

In 2001, Muroski returned to the Diocese of Erie from The Christophers and was retired. Muroski was permitted to move into the retired priest home in 2002, which is where he still resides. In 2016, the Diocese rostered a list of all the retired clergy living in the home and made it public. Muroski was not listed as a resident. It was at this residence that the Grand Jury found him living in 2017, however.

## Brother Edmundus Murphy

### Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1931
YEAR OF DEATH:	Unknown
ORDINATION:	1953

### Summary

On December 21, 2007 an e-mail communication was sent to Monsignor Robert Smith, Vicar General of the Diocese of Erie from the Society of the Divine Word in Techny, Illinois. The purpose of the e-mail was to inform Smith that a victim was sexually abused by a staff member while he was a minor at Sacred Heart High School in 1964. This school was operated by the Society of the Divine Word Missionaries in Girard.

The victim claimed that during the summer between his freshman and sophomore years of high school, Brother Edmundus Murphy, who was 33 years of age at this time, was the wrestling coach at the school. Murphy encouraged the victim to join the team and, under the pretense of teaching him some wrestling moves, the two wrestled naked "*as the ancient Greeks and Romans did.*" The victim alleged that during these "*wrestling*" sessions he was sodomized by Murphy.

Immediately after the incident, the victim asked Murphy what he was doing and, according to the victim, Murphy sat on the floor and began to cry.

The Grand Jury investigation found no documentation that the Diocese notified local law enforcement or the District Attorney's Office about Murphy's behavior. The only note in the file was a handwritten notation on top of the printed out e-mail which read; "*not responsible—Priest/Deacon only,*" "*Call Helen Schumacher to verify on 7/18/08.*" This was signed by R. Smith 7/18/08.

## Reverend John L. Murray

### Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1922
YEAR OF DEATH:	
ORDINATION:	May 15, 1947

### Employment/Assignment History

5/31/1947 – 5/28/1955	Sacred Heart, Parochial Vicar with Residence, Sharon, PA
5/28/1955 – 6/11/1960	St. Paul, Parochial Vicar with Residence, Erie, PA
8/25/1959 – 6/11/1960	St. Paul, Parochial Vicar with Residence. Special Duties, Part-Time Faculty, Erie Cathedral Preparatory, Erie, PA
6/11/1960 – 8/01/1966	Special Ministry, Erie Cathedral Preparatory, Erie, PA
8/27/1966 – 1/31/1969	Special Ministry, DuBois Central Catholic HS, Special Duties, Headmaster, DuBois, PA
6/16/1967 – 10/15/1968	St. Bernard, Administration with Residence, Falls Creek, PA
10/15/1968 – 5/26/1972	Health Leave
5/26/1972 – 1/04/1974	Special Ministry, Vicar Assistant with Residence, Our Lady Queen of the Americas, Conneaut Lake, PA
1/04/1974 – 6/01/1979	Pastor with Residence, Our Lady Queen of the Americas, Conneaut Lake, PA
6/01/1979 – 10/15/1985	Pastor with Residence, St. Matthew in the Wood, Erie, PA
10/15/1985 – 6/01/1987	Sick Leave
6/01/1987	Restricted, Erie, PA

### Summary

The Diocese of Erie received reports that Father John L. Murray sexually molested young boys in a church rectory before serving mass, as well as in recreational settings such as the lake shore. A review of his Diocesan file revealed that, as a result, the Diocese paid thousands of dollars in therapy fees and civil settlements. Two of his victims each received monetary settlements in the amount of \$25,000 each.

The first allegation of sexual abuse against Murray was made in 1967. It was reported that in the summer of 1966, Murray, while in a social setting with the victim's family at the shore, allegedly fondled the young boy in the water and on shore. This incident was brought to the attention of the boy's parents and Bishop John F. Whealon in 1967. There was no indication in the file that law enforcement was notified. Whealon's personal notes revealed that he confronted Murray with the accusation and spoke with the victim's father on a number of occasions. Murray partially denied the allegation by telling the Bishop that the victim has "*an overactive imagination,*" and that any touching was accidental due to normal roughhousing with the boy. The notes further indicated that the victim's father met with Murray and Murray apologized to him for the incident. The records revealed that Whealon convinced the family that

## Summary

nothing could be done in this case. Whealon wrote that the victim's mother and father have "*no doubt that this priest (Murray) did something wrong, in the water and on the shore.*" Whealon recorded the father as saying, "*If it was the first time, Father Murray is now so frightened that it will not happen again.*"

In April of 1985, Murray was charged by the Pennsylvania State Police with one count each of indecent assault and corruption of minors. He eventually pled guilty to both charges, was sentenced to twelve months' probation and fined. This incident was the result of Murray sexually molesting a 12-year-old boy who was preparing to serve mass in the church rectory. One year later, the church paid the victim's family a settlement in the amount of \$25,000.

As a result of Murray's second instance of child molestation, the Diocese disciplined him by removing his priestly faculties in 1985. While awaiting sentencing on his criminal charges, the Diocese sent Murray to two treatment facilities. After several years of treatment, paid for by the Diocese, Murray was retired and moved to his family home in Philadelphia. As of 2007, he was still receiving money to pay for his therapy.

Finally, in 2016, Bishop Lawrence Persico received the latest complaint against Murray. This incident came to the attention of the Diocese when the victim was visiting the Conneaut Lake area. According to Persico's handwritten file note, the victim, now 55 years of age, was a 12-year-old boy in 1973. He was cutting grass at Our Lady of the Americas church where Murray was the Pastor. Murray allegedly grabbed the child's genitals through the boy's clothes. Persico wrote to the victim on September 15, 2016 and advised him that the Diocese notified the Erie County District Attorney's Office and reported the incident to Childline. He further advised that Murray was out of ministry, was not permitted to function as a priest and offered to speak with the victim should he have any further questions.

## Father Giles L. Nealen, O.S.B.

### Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1923
YEAR OF DEATH:	1996
ORDINATION:	May 15, 1951

### Employment/Assignment History

1944-1951	Monastic maintenance department, St. Vincent Arch Abbey
1954-1963	Monastic maintenance department, St. Vincent Arch Abbey
1949-1951	Scholasticate Perfect
1951-1954	Assistant Pastor, Sacred Heart, St. Mary's, PA
1954-1963	Prefect, St. Vincent Scholasticate
1954-1963	Director of Food Service
1956-1963	Master of Brothers
1964	Pastor, St. James, Waynesburg, OH
1964-1967	Superior, St. Benedictine Priort, Vinhedo, S. P. Brazil
1967-1968	Administrator, St. Benedict, Marguerite
1968-1971	Assistant Pastor, Queen of the World, St. Mary's, PA
1971-1972	Pastor, St. Bruno, South Greensburg, PA
1972-1980	Pastor, St. James, Waynesburg, OH
1990-1992	Pastor, Sacred Heart, St. Mary's, PA

### Summary

A letter dated January 25, 1993 from a victim stated that 23 years earlier, when he was 13 years of age, he was sexually abused by Father Giles L. Nealen. At that time, Nealen was assigned to Queen of the World church in St. Mary. This letter stated that Nealen sexually abused him and two of his friends, but he was unsure if the other two victims would come forward. In this letter, the victim begged the church to keep Nealen away from other young boys so that they would not also be sexually assaulted by the priest.

A follow up letter, dated February 5, 1993 and addressed to Bishop Donald Trautman stated that the victim had sent the January 25 letter to Archbishop Nowicki at St. Vincent's Archabbey in Latrobe. There was no response to the victim or any correspondence regarding these letters in the file provided by the Diocese of Erie.

A May 10, 2002 e-mail correspondence to Trautman stated that a woman wanted to report the sexual abuse of young boys by Nealen. This woman claimed that she knew of at least three boys that were sexually abused by Nealen. Specifically, she had recently found out that an old friend of hers, Victim #1, was arrested for also sexually abusing young boys. The e-mailer was very distressed about this and when she discussed this information with her brother,

## Summary

he told her that Nealen had made sexual advances toward him and two of his friends while on a camping trip. She was told by her brother that both other boys, Victim #1 being one of them, were forced to perform sex acts on Nealen. The writer went on to say that during Victim #1's trial he testified that he had been an altar boy and had been sexually abused during that time.

The only response that was enclosed in the files provided by the Erie Diocese to this e-mailer was a four sentence e-mail from Bishop Trautman telling her that Father Giles Nealen died on December 29, 1996. He also told her that he spoke with the Archabbot, who asked the Bishop to forward the e-mail to him and that he hoped she would hear from him shortly. It should be noted that there is no response correspondence from the Archabbot to this e-mailer in the file provided by the Erie Diocese.

In an undated letter from another woman, she claimed that thirty years prior her eleven-year-old son was sexually abused by Nealen. She stated that she and her family were members of The Queen of the World in Elk County where Nealen was the priest assigned at that time. The letter tells how she noticed a drastic change in her son's behavior from a "*happy go lucky child to a pensive and irritable child.*" She noted that even his handwriting changed from a "*bold nature to a restricted light hand*" and how she could not figure out why. She claimed that around this same time, Nealen was abruptly removed from the parish and that no explanation was given to the members of the parish for this removal. The letter writer stated that a few years later she was talking with two other women who mentioned something about Nealen and the reason he left the parish. She claims that she was shocked, but suddenly things fell into place and she berated herself for being so stupid. This writer claimed that thirty years later her son had never married, would not enter a Catholic church and was still severely affected by the sexual abuse he endured from Nealen. An electronic mail response from Trautman, dated March 31, 2004, stated that he received her March 19<sup>th</sup> letter. He told her that what happened to her son was before his time and "*certainly unknown to my predecessors.*" He apologized and told her that he would forward her letter to Archabbot Douglas Nowicki for his response. It should be noted that Bishop wrote a letter and forwarded it to the Archabbot, but that no response letter to this writer by the Archabbot was found in the files provided by the Diocese.

A cassette tape enclosed in the file of Nealen labeled "*victim's father*" is a recording of an on-air interview from radio show "*Erie in the morning*" of a father of one of the victims of sexual abuse of an unnamed priest. The father of the unnamed victim tells a heart-wrenching story of how he and his family went to the local parish in the mid-1970s and befriended the priest there. The victim's father told the hosts of the radio show that he was approached by a friend who told him that he had "*walked in on*" this priest sexually abusing his own son and was concerned that the son of this man had also been sexually abused. When the father asked his young son if anyone had ever touched him, he claimed that his son started to cry and told him that their local priest had. The victim's father told the radio hosts how this priest was "*part of their family*" and that he would come and stay the entire weekend at their home. His son told him that the priest would come into his room after he and his wife went to bed to sexually abuse him. The victim's father claims his son would have been between the ages of nine and fourteen at the time of this abuse. When the victim's father confronted the priest, who had recently left the parish, he claimed the priest did not deny that he sexually abused his son and told him the

## Summary

reason he did it was because "*his son needed love.*" When the victim's father told the priest he wanted them to go to the Bishop and tell him what happened, that the priest refused to go because he didn't want to be removed and that he would lose his pension. The victim's father tried several times to set up a meeting with the Bishop to discuss the sexual abuse, but he claims it never worked out.

The Diocesan files received pursuant to subpoena contained no information on any of these victim's statuses or if any of them were offered counseling. The Grand Jury investigation found no documentation that the Diocese of Erie notified local law enforcement or the District Attorney's office about Nealen's long history of sexually abusing numerous young boys.

The Diocese of Greensburg also provided limited information regarding Nealen in response to the subpoena. An unmarked folder within the Diocese of Greensburg's files contained a letter, dated July 13, 1972, from Father Egbert Donovan, O.S.B to Bishop Connare. The letter described a series of transfers for multiple priests. More significantly, the letter contained one sentence regarding Nealen, and suggested that he was involved in an inappropriate incident. The sentence stated, "*For reasons already known by you, it is wise and prudent to reassign the present Pastor, Father Giles Nealen, O.S.B., at this time.*" This letter suggested that both the Diocese of Greensburg and the Archabbot of St. Vincent were aware of Nealen's actions.

A hand written note contained in the file (author unknown) lists:

*"Pastor St. Bruno – July 1971 – July 1972  
Served in Marguerite – Oct 1967 – Aug 1968  
Died December 29, 1996"*

It does not appear that the Diocese of Greensburg provided any further information regarding Nealen.

# Father Jan Olowin

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1942
YEAR OF DEATH:	Unknown
ORDINATION:	May 18, 1968

## Employment/Assignment History

1966	Jesuit Missions, Juliaca, Peru
1967	Migrant Ministry, Erie, PA
6/16/1968 – 9/02/1970	St. Patrick, Erie, PA
6/16/1968 – 9/02/1970	Faculty, Cathedral Preparatory, Erie, PA
9/02/1970 – 3/09/1984	St. Patrick, Erie, PA
8/16/1971 – 1/31/1983	Chaplain, Soldiers and Sailors Home
3/09/1984 – 8/25/1986	St. Adalbert, Sharon, PA
8/25/1986 – 11/07/1992	St. Joseph, Oil City, PA
11/07/1992 – 6/28/1998	St. George, Erie, PA
6/28/1998 – 12/21/1998	Sabbatical, American College of Louvain
12/21/1998 – 6/05/1999	St. Joseph, Sharon, PA
6/06/1999 – 12/31/2007	Chaplain, FCI McKean, Bradford, PA
1/01/2008 – 8/21/2008	Sabbatical
8/22/2008 – 8/31/2012	St. Michael, Emlenton, PA
8/22/2008 – 8/31/2012	Chaplain, Clarion University of Pennsylvania, Clarion, PA
10/21/2016 – 11/04/2016	Temporary Parochial Administrator, St. Elizabeth Seton, Sun City, AZ

## Summary

The Diocese of Erie personnel file for Father Jan Olowin contained a document entitled “*Summary of Phone Conversation.*” It was the memorialization of a telephone conversation that was written by Robert J. Smith, Vicar General, on May 27, 1993. The document recorded the alleged abuse of a victim by Olowin. Victim #1. It is the Diocesan notes regarding a phone call Smith had with Victim #2, who is a victim of clergy sex abuse himself. These notes record some of Victim #2’s abuse and record Victim #2 informing the Diocese of his friend’s (Victim #1) abuse. Victim #2 said he was disillusioned with the Church when Olowin was appointed pastor of St. George. Victim #2 explains that Victim #3, who was also a friend of his, was sexually accosted by Olowin while on a trip to Mexico. The document does not record the age of Victim #3, only that he was young at the time of the assault. Victim #2 tells Smith that Victim #3 was able to fight off Olowin’s sexual advances by pushing him away. Sometime later Victim #3 shared the incident with Victim #2, who subsequently shared the story with Smith in 1993.

On November 4, 2016, Bishop Lawrence Persico wrote a letter to Olowin, now retired in Peoria, Arizona, indicating that he had learned of an allegation of clerical misconduct made

## **Summary**

several decades ago against Olowin. Persico's letter did not mention details, but it referenced a phone call that Persico and Olowin had the day before. The Grand Jury can infer that Persico outlined Olowin's offences in this call and articulated the reason for the letter in greater detail. This letter officially restricted Olowin from public exercise of all priestly ministry until further notice.

The Grand Jury was unable to determine from the subpoenaed files what prompted Persico to restrict Olowin's priestly faculties twenty-three years after Olowin's name was first associated with sexual abuse. In a later production of files to the Grand Jury, a letter from the Bishop of Phoenix, Arizona to Olowin was found. This document was dated November 18, 2016 and was written to Olowin and carbon copied Persico in Erie. It thanked Olowin for his service and informed him that, due to a letter received from Persico, Olowin would be restricted from all ministry until the matter of the alleged abuse was resolved. It is unknown if the investigation of Olowin is continuing or if law enforcement was ever notified.

# Father Andrew Pawlaczyk

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1936
YEAR OF DEATH:	1982
ORDINATION:	May 31, 1962

## Employment/Assignment History

6/09/1962 – 1971	Faculty, Cathedral Preparatory, Erie PA
1/22/1971 – 1976	Chaplain, United States Army
8 /1976 – 1978	Chaplain, Hamot Medical Center, Erie PA
5/01/1978 – 1982	Chaplain, Unites States Army

## Summary

In a letter dated April 20, 2011 and addressed to Bishop Trautman, a victim reported abuse by Father Andrew Pawlaczyk. The victim explained that it began when the victim was a student at Erie Cathedral Preparatory. and Pawlaczyk took him to football games where they were permitted to sit in the press box. Soon after that, Pawlaczyk began taking the victim to steam baths, one on the East side, and another on West 8<sup>th</sup> Street. They sat naked together and Pawlaczyk noted that it was not unusual for one man to whisk the back of another with a strange looking brush while in the steam bath.

Pawlaczyk built a fairly strong relationship with the victim's parents and began visiting their home regularly. That type of relationship building continued for several months. The following summer, Pawlaczyk picked up the victim and took him to a cottage on the lakefront. The first thing they did was go swimming without swim suits. Although the victim thought it was strange, he attributed the behavior to simply being rebellious. After swimming they went back to the cottage. Pawlaczyk took the victim into the bedroom and told him that he was going to give him a massage. The victim was face down on the bed with no clothes on. Pawlaczyk then sat on the victim's buttocks - - wearing no clothers - - while he massaged him. Then they reversed roles. After they were done, the victim found ejaculate in the bed which was not from him.

When Pawlaczyk was serving in the United States Army and stationed at Walter Reed Hospital, the victim's parents arranged for the victim to fly to Washington, D.C. by himself. When he arrived, Pawlaczyk took him to the Kennedy Center for a concert and to a basketball game to watch "Pistol" Pete Maravich. From the time he arrived, Pawlaczyk supplied him with cigarettes and alcohol. After a few nights, Pawlaczyk suggested that instead of sleeping in separate rooms, they should sleep on fold out beds in the living room. They again performed mutual massages and then Pawlaczyk fondled the victim's genitals. Pawlaczyk asked him, "*Have you ever had an erection like this?*" That same evening Pawlaczyk took the victim into the shower so they could wash each other. Pawlaczyk also let the victim drink heavily amd the

## **Summary**

victim did not recall what occurred the following night. The next day, the victim left for home and never saw Pawlaczyk again.

The Grand Jury did not find any documentation that indicated that the Diocese ever reported the case to local law enforcement. Additionally, there is no indication that the Diocese offered any counselling to the victim.

# Reverend John A. Piatkowski

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1898
YEAR OF DEATH:	1970
ORDINATION:	November 10, 1935

## Employment/Assignment History

11/11/1935 – 5/21/1948	St. Stanislaus Koska, Erie/Tyler, PA
5/22/1948 – 11/16/1970	Assumption, Sykesville, PA

## Summary

In a letter dated March 16, 1955 and addressed to the Bishop of Erie, a victim reported abuse by Father John A. Piatkowski. He advised that at the age of 12, he became an altar boy. Growing up, he was taught by his parents and the Catechism that priests were Christ's representative and would not do anything wrong.

During his time as an altar boy, Piatkowski began to kiss the victim and tell him that he loved him. He took the victim for rides and to the movies. It was during this time that Piatkowski would play with the victim's penis until he had an orgasm. On numerous other occasions, Piatkowski committed similar abuse on the victim in the church basement and in the parish house where Piatkowski lived. The victim related that while he felt that the entire situation did not seem right, he was afraid to tell his parents for fear that they would not have believed him.

The Grand Jury reviewed a letter dated October 29, 1959 authored by "A married and devout Catholic" that was addressed to the Archbishop of Erie, Reverend John Mark Gannon. The letter indicated that the writer was requesting on behalf of the parish in Sykesville that the parish be assigned a new priest. The letter stated that Piatkowski had been molesting little boys, and that the boys were afraid to talk. The letter alleged that Piatkowski made nervous wrecks out of the children and that they were afraid of him. It is unknown to the Grand Jury if this incident was ever referred to law enforcement by the Diocese.

In a report authored by Bishop Donald W. Troutman, he indicated that on December 19, 2008, he met with a victim and his wife at the St. Catherine rectory in DuBois. The victim reported that Piatkowski repeatedly sexually abused him when he was approximately seven or eight years old. The sexual abuse took place in the 1940's in a small parish in Tyler. Troutman referred the victim to counseling and reported the matter to Erie County District Attorney's Office on January 5, 2009.

# Father David L. Poulson

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1953
YEAR OF DEATH:	Unknown
ORDINATION:	June 22, 1979

## Employment/Assignment History

7/05/1979 - 6/09/1982	Faculty, Bradford Central Christian High School, Bradford, PA Weekend Education, St. Francis of Assisi, Bradford, PA
6/09/1982 - 8/24/1997	Faculty, Gannon University
6/01/1991 - 8/24/1997	Director, Parochial Administrator Gannon University
8/24/1997 - 12/03/1997	Administrator, St. Francis of Assisi, Clearfield, PA
12/03/1997 - 6/06/2000	Pastor, St. Agnes, Morrisdale, PA
6/06/2000 - 7/24/2001	Sp. Ministries, Clarion University/Catholic Chaplain
6/07/2000 - 6/30/2006	Pastor, St. Michael, Fryburg, PA
8/08/2000	Chaplain, Dio. Div. of World Apostolate of Fatima
7/01/2006 - 11/08/2010	Pastor, St Michael (2 <sup>nd</sup> 6 year term), Fryburg, PA
11/08/2010 - 11/08/2016	Pastor, St. Anthony of Padua
11/08/2010 - 11/08/2016	Pastor, St. Bernadette, Cambridge Springs, PA
1/13/2012 - 9/11/2014	Dean, Meadville Deanery, Complete term of Father O'Hern
11/01/2013 - 10/31/2018*	Other, Bishop's Delegate to Mass in the Extraordinary
11/29/2013 - 11/28/2018*	Other, Diocesan Liaison to the Catholic Charismatic Renewal
9/12/2014 - 9/11/2019*	Dean, Meadville Deanery
9/12/2014 - 9/11/2019*	Diocesan Board, Presbyteral Council, Erie, PA

\* Refers to unfinished appointment

## Summary

See presentment of Fortieth Statewide Investigating Grand Jury.

# Father John Philip Schanz

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1924
YEAR OF DEATH:	2010
ORDINATION:	May 18, 1950

## Employment/Assignment History

6/05/1950 – 09/01/1950	Temporary Parochial Administrator St. Elizabeth, Smethport, PA
9/01/1950 – 10/01/1996	Faculty; Professor of Theology Gannon University, Erie, PA
9/01/1950 – 10/01/1996	Weekend Assistant Holy Cross, Fairview, PA
6/13/1960 – 10/01/1996	Regional Director of the College Branch Of the Confraternity of Christian Doctrine Gannon College, Mercyhurst College & Villa Maria College
4/06/1962	Examiner of Junior Clergy of the Diocese of Erie
3/08/1967	Appointed as Advocate of the Tribunal of the Diocese of Erie
5/14/1969	Advocate of the Tribunal of the Diocese of Erie
10/01/1996 – 4/17/2002	Retires from Gannon University to private residence
4/17/2002	Withdraws from Priestly Ministry and removed of any faculties
4/16/2010	Deceased

## Summary

Based on information provided by the Diocese of Erie, a victim wrote a letter to Bishop Donald Trautman that was postmarked April 11, 2002. In the letter, the victim detailed an assault which occurred in 1969 or 1970 when he was going into seventh or eighth grade and was an altar boy at St. Andrew and The Villa. According to the victim, he met John Philip Schanz, who invited him to his apartment on the southwest corner of 6<sup>th</sup> and Sassafras Street. Schanz began to wrestle the boy and grab his body. When the victim asked his older brother, who was a Gannon College student at the time, if he knew of Schanz, his brother began to laugh and remarked “*you mean the one who likes little boys?*”

It should be noted that there is a gap in documentation in the file from when the initial letter was sent by the victim and May 2014.

In a letter dated November 17, 2015, Bishop Lawrence T. Persico stated that, based on the information he was provided, Bishop Trautman had offered the victim professional

## Summary

counseling in 2002 but the victim had declined this offer. Additionally, in an e-mail from victim to Persico, the victim acknowledged that he had declined Trautman's offer of help in 2002.

Within the Diocese file provided, there was also a Post-It note that stated that there was a message left for Monsignor Smith from Victim #1 on May 12, 2014. The message was attached to a piece of paper on which Smith noted that he called the victim on May 12, 2014 and May 14, 2014.

A handwritten note by Trautman revealed that on Sunday, May 18, 2014, he called the victim. They two discussed the victim's "*situation.*" Trautman wrote that he reviewed the actions which had been taken for the removal of Schanz, a teacher at Gannon University, and later stated that he himself had removed Schanz from the active ministry. Trautman also noted that the victim was still bothered by the incident of abuse and that Trautman had assured him of "*our help & guidance.*" Trautman noted in these documents that the victim suffered from a troubled marriage, anxiety, nightmares, and guilt regarding the incident with Schanz.

In a letter written to victim from Persico and dated February 23, 2016, it was noted that enclosed with the letter was a check in the amount of \$32,000 as a final reimbursement owed to him from the Diocese of Erie for his counseling. It was also stated that the check supplemented the \$12,500 check which he had already received from the Diocese and concluded all financial reimbursement.

In a letter postmarked May 9, 2002 and addressed "*Attn: Bishop Catholic Diocese,*" a second victim wrote that in the early 1970's he had attended a Gannon University basketball game and was approached by Schanz. Schanz asked he victim if he would like to go to all of the games, to which the victim replied that he would. According to the victim, after the games, they would go to Schanz's apartment at the rectory on West 6<sup>th</sup> Street, where Schanz always wanted to drink and wrestle. The victim was 12 or 13 years of age at the time.

The victim went on to note that he was writing the letter from prison. He stated that he was incarcerated as a result of crimes that he had committed under the influence of drugs and alcohol. He attributed his substance abuse problem to the sexual abuse that he had endured at the hands of Schanz years prior. The victim sought acknowledgement from the church that they had received the letter and expressed a desire to know if Schanz was still alive and whether or not he was still victimizing individuals.

Trautman responded to the victim's letter. He stated that he wished to acknowledge the unfortunate incidents that occurred to him in the early 1970's. Trautman informed the victim that Schanz was no longer celebrating the sacraments or mass publicly and that he was in frail health. Additionally, Trautman noted that Schanz was no longer representing the church in any public way and did not wear clerical garb.

Bishop Trautman went on to write that he was glad the victim brought his concerns to the Bishop's attention and that he deeply regretted the tragic circumstances of his life that may have been influenced by his contact with Schanz. The Bishop told the victim that he prayed that

## Summary

the Lord would bring him healing and to leave the past in the past and go on to find happiness and peace in his life.

The second victim wrote to Trautman again on October 30, 2002, seeking assistance from the Catholic Charities upon his release from prison. Ultimately, at the request of Trautman, the Director of Catholic Charities Counseling and Adoption Services reached out to the victim and offered assistance upon his release.

The second victim's allegations were reported to the Erie County District Attorney's Office.

On January 2, 2007, Monsignor Robert Smith received an e-mail outlining an incident that occurred in 1974 when the writer was 17 years old and in a supervisory role at Camp Glinoda. The writer would later state that the incident had actually occurred at Camp Notre Dame. The writer recalled an instance when approximately 20 children jumped into the pool. Schanz jumped into the pool as well, but seemed to focus on one boy in particular. The lifeguard noticed Schanz hugging the boy, as well as picking the boy up out of the water and dunking him under water. The lifeguard told the writer to get the children out of the water. The unknown boy then told the writer that he wanted to show Schanz something in the cabin. A few minutes passed and the writer went looking for them. The boy and Schanz eventually emerged from the woods. The writer did not recall whether or not the pair were clothed, as he looked away. He asked the boy later in the day what had been going on. The boy described the incident as "*weird*." The writer reported the incident to camp administrators. He was advised that they would take care of the matter and that they should keep it to themselves.

The Diocese was able to identify a James O'Connor as being the Director of Camp Notre Dame in the 1970's possibly in 1974 at the time of the allegation. However, O'Connor stated that he did not recall anyone coming forward in his five years as Director to report an incident of clergy sexual abuse.

The allegation was reported to the Erie County District Attorney's Office.

On April 15, 2002, another victim sent an e-mail message to Trautman about abuse that he had suffered at the hand of Schanz. He stated that in 1974, he was an altar boy at Holy Cross Church. Shortly thereafter, Schanz began taking him to his cottage on Lake Erie to go boating and provided him with alcohol nearly every weekend. The victim stated that he would fall asleep and wake up to Schanz kissing him on the lips or touching his genitals. Additionally, Schanz would take off the victim's clothing while he believed the victim was sleeping and photograph him nude, specifically his genitals. Schanz would also masturbate in front of the victim after he had removed his clothing and believed him to be asleep. The victim stated that Schanz would kiss him a lot, at times attempting to French kiss him, but that he would not allow that to happen. According to the victim, Schanz would buy him gifts and clothes and take him to dinner, the movies and even on trips to Florida in the winter months. While he knew what had happened to him was wrong, he never told anyone.

## Summary

The victim reported that when he was 20 years old, he and his now ex-wife, went to Father Orbaniek to be married. Prior to their marriage, Orbaniek told the victim's now ex-wife about what had happened between the victim and Schanz. Orbaniek also told her about incidents between Schanz and other boys. As a result of Orbaniek's statements, the victim and his wife ended up divorcing after 18 years of marriage. Finally, the victim stated that he had letters he had written to Schanz about the abuse.

In the e-mail that the victim sent to Trautman, he stated that an attorney he had been in contact with wanted to file suit against the Diocese, the Vatican, Schanz and Orbaniek.

In the documents provided pursuant to subpoena, it was noted that Schanz's attorney reached out to the victim and requested that all correspondence go through him. On the copy of the correspondence that the attorney sent to the victim, there was a hand written note by Trautman which stated, "*this case was settled directly by Father Schanz & [his attorney] for \$50,000*" –DWT June 21, 2002.

Based on the information provided by the Diocese of Erie, namely two sheets of notes handwritten by Bishop Donald Trautman, in an unknown year an unidentified additional victim came forward with allegations that Schanz had sexually abused him. The abuse took place in 1978 or 1979 when Victim #5 was sixteen or seventeen years old. Schanz befriended Victim #5 and invited him to his home on West 6<sup>th</sup> Street in Erie. Victim #5 went on to state that Schanz had given him alcohol, which caused him to be "*tipsy*" and that Schanz French kissed him while attempting to pull his pants down. Additionally, Victim #5 stated that the worst incident had occurred at Schanz's cabin in Fairview, PA.

The notes go on to say that the Victim #5 had visited Schanz 3 or 4 months prior to the handwritten notes. Additionally, the notes state that Father Schanz had given Victim #5 an 'F' in a course that he taught. Another written note outlined "*pay for counseling*" with the calculations of \$85.00 per session, one session per week for fifty-two weeks. There is also a note about schooling at the cost of \$17,000, but no indication as to where this schooling may have been. It should be noted that these handwritten notes, which do not identify the Victim #5, were found in the file of Victim #6.

The first page of this file received from the Diocese of Erie is a single sheet of paper with the word "*Redacted*" printed on it. In the Diocese of Erie File labeled Victim #6-SCHANZ, there are handwritten notes by Bishop Donald Trautman that outline the abuse which was suffered by Victim #6 at the hand of Schanz. At the time of the abuse, Schanz was working at the Cathedral at Gannon University (G.U.). Victim #6's abuse began when he was 15 years old and took place between the years 1980 and 1983. The file contains a note that states "*told Monsignor Slatin*". The notes read that Victim #6 had no friends and was from a dysfunctional family. His father was an abusive alcoholic. Schanz had invited Victim #6 to his West 6<sup>th</sup> Street residence and gave him alcohol on many occasions. Bishop Trautman notes that the worst incidents of abuse occurred at Schanz's cabin in Fairview, Pennsylvania where Schanz would French kiss the Victim, massage him while clothed and unclothed, and rub oil on his body. It was noted that Victim #6 massaged Schanz as well. As a result of the abuse that Victim #6

## Summary

endured, he suffered from severe depression and considered himself to be a womanizer. His wife deserted him and he was actively receiving counseling. Perhaps the most telling sentence in Bishop Trautman's handwritten notes is the statement "*another person abused by Father Schanz.*"

In what appears to be a list of compensation that Victim #6 was to receive, Bishop Trautman noted "*small settlement, education, therapy costs.*" Additionally, Bishop Trautman made a list that appears to outline his plan for dealing with Schanz stating "*1. Retire from G.U. 2. Change location/residence 3. WE-what is being done 4. Counseling- St. Xavier or St. Luke's*"

Bishop Trautman made notes from information which he appears to have obtained from Schanz as a result of Victim #6 coming forward. It notes "72" which is the age that Father Schanz would have been in 1996 when Victim #6 came forward. "*No sex attraction, 3 in area, craving for friendship no sex involvement would call from Cleveland. Did give rubdown to other fellow.*" The notes continue stating "*Admits no guilt but some settlement (Aug. 5) give up Holy Cross- no contact w. youth stay at (illegible) house.*"

The remainder of the file contains documentation related to Schanz's retirement from Gannon University, including a letter from Monsignor David A. Rubino, President of Gannon University dated August 19, 1996, which is the same date that Victim #6 met with Bishop Trautman. The letter stated that Schanz was paid at his normal salary until his insurance was transferred to the Diocese of Erie. Additionally, Monsignor Rubino allowed Schanz to take his mattress with him, as a token of the University's appreciation for his service.

A letter written to Bishop Trautman by Victim #6's attorney, John H. Moore, Esq. of Erie, stated that he discussed the "*ramifications of trying to pursue a legal claim for something that occurred so long ago as well as the additional trauma that would be an inevitable result of the litigation.*" Victim #6 sought compensation from the Diocese of Erie for his counseling sessions with Psychologist Jacqueline Phillips, as well as payment for tuition, books, room and board for Cuyahoga Community College where Victim #6 was pursuing his Associates Degree. Copies of the course catalog were included in the file to show proof of enrollment costs. Ultimately, on September 18, 1996, Victim #6 signed a General Release stating that he received \$8,800 in "*full satisfaction of payment for or on account of any and all liability of any kind whatsoever including vicarious liability for alleged indecent assaults and/or acts perpetrated by Reverend John P. Schanz. This release forever discharged Reverend John. P Schanz, Gannon College, now known as Gannon University, Bishop Michael J. Murphy, Bishop Donald W. Trautman and the Diocese of Erie.*" Additionally, there is a bill from Daniel J. Brabender, Jr., Esquire for \$425.00 for his services to the Diocese of Erie for the matter of Victim #6/Father Schanz.

A supplemental document written by Monsignor Robert J. Smith, Vicar General, on April 18, 2002, which was not in the Diocese file for Schanz and is titled "*Summary Report #4*", outlines the sexual abuse allegation by a thirty-two-year-old male believed to be Victim #6 and the steps taken by the Diocese of Erie to settle the matter. Additionally, though there are

## Summary

no victim names listed in this document, the document appears to outline the reporting of sexual abuse by victims #1 and #4 at the hand of Schanz.

Based on the documents received from the Diocese of Erie, on March 1, 2005, Barbara Edwards, a psychologist local to the Erie area, called the Diocese to alert them that one of her clients, Victim #7, had alleged that he was abused by Schanz.

In a letter written to Monsignor Smith dated February 28, 2005, Victim #7 described how his life since a young age had been filled with drug and alcohol abuse, promiscuous sexual activity, emotional issues, and physical health problems. Victim #7 was an altar boy who only felt at home and purposeful in the church. According to this victim, Schanz enjoyed engaging in recreational activities with the altar boys. Schanz would intimidate Victim #7 and hold him underwater repeatedly, scaring him terribly. Schanz then took Victim #7 to a bath house, where he *“did things he should not have done.”* Victim #7 does not recall how many times this happened. According to Victim #7, his life is now clean and sober. He is happily married with three children and is a successful licensed professional counselor, yet he misses the closeness of the parish community.

On Diocese of Erie letterhead, Bishop Donald Trautman recalled the following interaction with himself, Monsignor Smith and Barbara Edwards. According to Bishop Trautman, Victim #7 was in the sixth grade at St. Andrew’s in Erie, PA at the time of the abuse suffered at the hands of Schanz. According to Bishop Trautman, Schanz helped at St. Andrews in the summer. Bishop Trautman wrote that Schanz took Victim #7 and a few other boys to the beach to go swimming, where Schanz became aggressive with Victim #7. Bishop Trautman went on to write that Schanz took Victim #7 to a bath house or sauna, where he rubbed Victim #7 down with oak leaves. Victim #7 stated *“he spent too much time on my genital and rectum.”* This bothered Victim #7 greatly and he told his father. His father told him to stay away from Schanz. Bishop Trautman wrote that the Victim did not want Schanz *“hurt” or “disciplined.”* Additionally, Bishop Trautman offered to pay for counseling, Victim #7 told him that he did not think it was necessary because he had insurance.

Bishop Trautman went on to write that Victim #7 wanted to return to the Church, so Monsignor Smith took his confession and they discussed reentry to Mass. Bishop Trautman wrote that he called Schanz, who admitted to taking boys to the beach, but that Schanz adamantly denied ever going to a sauna or bath house. Bishop Trautman wrote that he informed Edwards of Schanz’s statements.

## Reverend Samuel B. Slocum

### Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1951
YEAR OF DEATH:	
ORDINATION:	May 16, 1980

### Employment/Assignment History

6/05/1980 – 8/12/1983	Secondary Education, DuBois C.C. High School, DuBois, PA
6/05/1980 – 8/12/1983	Weekend Asst. St. Michael, DuBois, PA
8/12/1983 – 6/14/1985	Secondary Education, Elk Co. Catholic St. Mary's, PA
8/12/1983 – 6/14/1985	Resident at Faculty House, Elk Co. Catholic School, St Mary's, PA
11/15/1984 – 6/14/1985	Resident at Holy Rosary, Johnsonburg, PA
1/05/1985 – 6/14/1985	Administrator, St. Benedict, Ridgway, PA
6/14/1985 – 8/07/1989	Secondary Education, Erie Cathedral Preparatory, Erie, PA
6/14/1985 – 8/07/1989	Weekend Asst. Holy Trinity, Erie, PA
8/07/1989 – 11/01/1994	Secondary Education, Bradford Central Christian High School, Bradford, PA
8/07/1989 – 11/19/1990	Weekend Asst., St. Bernard, Eldred, PA
11/19/1990 – 11/01/1994	Administrator, St. Bernard, Eldred, PA
11/01/1994 – 11/03/19/97	Administrator, St. Bernard, Eldred, PA
11/01/1994 – 8/01/1995	Secondary Education, Bradford Central Christian High School, Bradford, PA
8/01/1995 – 12/15/1997	Sick Leave
1/26/1997 – 6/30/1999	Administrator, St. Theresa Shinglehouse
11/03/19/97 – 7/31/2001	Pastor with residence, St. Raphael, Eldred, PA
8/01/2001 – 4/01/2011	Pastor with residence, Our Mother of Perpetual Help, Ephrata, PA
8/01/2001 – 4/01/2011	Pastor, St. Francis of Assisi
4/01/2011 -	Leave of Absence/Suspension

### Summary

Father Samuel B. Slocum testified before the Grand Jury on September 14, 2017, detailing his days as a priest in the Diocese of Erie. In 2012, a jury found him guilty of the crimes of concealment of the whereabouts of a child and corruption of minors

Slocum testified that in 1980 he had been reported to Monsignor Heberlein by a fellow priest for an alleged inappropriate relationship with a fourteen-year-old girl. Slocum testified that Heberlein and then-Bishop Michael Murphy knew about his relationship with the young girl, but did nothing about it. In this same year, Slocum also recalled having a relationship with a sixteen-year-old boy. He testified that he would not call his relationships with these children

## Summary

inappropriate. He said that he did get some sort of emotional or sexual gratification from relationships with children, however. Slocum testified that while he never touched the girl, he did engage in physical wrestling, tickling and touching of the young boy. Slocum befriended his intended victims by gaining the trust of their parents and then engaging the children in inappropriate relationships or what is now known as “grooming”. Slocum engaged in grooming behavior with four children before he was finally arrested.

When Slocum described his relationships with fourteen-year-old Victim #1 and seventeen-year-old Victim #2, he testified to the Grand Jury that these girls were in love with him and wrote him love letters. When questioned about groping Victim #2’s buttocks and upper thigh, Slocum summed up the touching as accidental in nature. He informed the Grand Jury that to escape the accusation by Victim #2, he enlisted the assistance of a third party to apply pressure to Victim #2 and have her recant her accusation against him. Slocum testified that he had this mutual friend talk to Victim #2’s family because, *“I felt like I was saving my neck, to be honest.”*

Slocum added that he and Victim #2’s family remain friendly to this day and exchange Christmas cards. Diocesan records showed that Bishop Trautman and the Diocese opened an investigation into the Victim #2 groping incident and quickly closed it in less than two days. Trautman’s handwritten notes in the Slocum–Victim #2 file reads, *“Sam Slocum – Denied Categorically All Aspects.”*

Slocum testified in the Grand Jury about Victim #3’s case, the fifteen-year-old victim for whom Slocum was eventually convicted of felony and misdemeanor charges relating to grooming behavior. Slocum admitted to buying the friendship of Victim #3 and others with gifts and allowing them to stay at his residence in the rectory, even when their parents forbid it. Slocum taught Victim #3 how to hide their communications on social media by deleting text and photographs. Some of the texts that Slocum sent to Victim #3 would later be used against him in court and are sexually suggestive in nature. Slocum texted Victim #3, *“I always knew there was something special about you, but I never knew what it was, Majic,”* and, *“I’m trying not to say bad stuff but your [sic] pushing it.”*

In Victim #3’s case, Slocum bought him items from Abercrombie and Fitch and would later make Victim #3 negotiate to get them. In one text exchange, Slocum informed Victim #3 that a package has arrived. When Victim #3 texted back asking what it was, Slocum responded that the Abercrombie and Fitch package is now in. Slocum texted, *“It’s in my bedroom, it came from the post office today. You can start negotiations anytime...”* Slocum claimed that Victim #3 memorized his credit card number and made the purchases himself. Slocum asserted that he never reported this theft to law enforcement or the boy’s parents because he did not want to get the boy in trouble. It also came out in court proceedings that Slocum hid the whereabouts of Victim #3 from his parents and coached Victim #3 to lie to his parents.

This behavior that Slocum exhibited in the aforementioned cases was again apparent in 1995 when the Diocese became aware of another target of Slocum’s grooming. This incident was addressed in a letter dated May 10, 1995, from Monsignor Charles Kaza to Bishop Trautman. In that letter, Kaza outlines Slocum’s *“unhealthy relationship”* with a high school

## Summary

senior. The letter described how Slocum worked late hours with this student outside the school grounds, offered the student cash, and invited him to drink beer. This report came from the student's own mother to Monsignor Kaza at great risk to her employment. This mother was, at the time, a teacher employed by the Diocese. The letter went on to describe how the victim felt uncomfortable with the level of Slocum's closeness and that Slocum routinely violated his personal space. Slocum denied any physical sexual contact with this student, but admitted that the relationship certainly filled a void in his life.

In an attempt to get Slocum help for his inappropriate behavior toward children, the Diocese sent him to psychotherapy on two occasions. His first stint in therapy occurred in 1991 at the Diocese's own treatment facility in Erie called the Ecclesiastic Center. There Slocum received treatment that the Diocese called "*Growth Counseling*," along with fellow accused pedophiles Rev. Thomas Smith and Rev. Gary Ketchum. Slocum's second stint at psychotherapy occurred in 1995 at the St. Michael Center in St. Louis, Missouri, which is an inpatient facility. Slocum was sent there eight days after the Monsignor Kaza letter to Trautman was sent regarding the student discussed above. Upon his discharge from the St. Michael Treatment Center in January of 1997, Slocum was placed back into ministry, where he remained until 2011. In 2011, the allegations that led to Slocum's eventual arrest surfaced and the Diocese placed him on suspension until he was laicized by Rome and removed from ministry.

Slocum's canon law case and Slocum's conviction were documented in what the Catholic Church called "*The Acts of the Case*" or "*The Acts of Slocum*." In the documents provided to the Grand Jury, nowhere was it found that Trautman informed his superiors in Rome that Slocum had a history dating back to 1980 involving four other victims. Slocum's dismissal from ministry was based solely on his criminal arrest and the incidents involving Victim #3. Additionally, no evidence was ever found that the Diocese of Erie had ever notified law enforcement of Slocum's predatory behavior, nor was there any evidence found that the Diocese notified law enforcement at the time of the Victim #3 investigation that Slocum had a predatory history that dated back 30 years.

# Monsignor Thomas Snyderwine

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1943
YEAR OF DEATH:	
ORDINATION:	May 8, 1968

## Employment/Assignment History

6/05/1968 - 6/03/1971	Weekend Asst., St. Michael, DuBois, PA
6/05/1968 - 6/03/1971	Faculty, DuBois Central Catholic, DuBois, PA
1/01/1970 - 6/01/1970	Administrator, St. Joseph, DuBois, PA
6/03/1971 - 6/05/1976	Faculty, Erie Cathedral Preparatory, Erie, PA
6/03/1971 - 5/31/1974	Weekend Asst., St. Boniface, Erie, PA
5/31/1974 - 6/05/1976	Weekend Asst., St. Patrick's School, Erie, PA
6/05/1976 - 9/01/1979	Parochial Vicar, St. Patrick's, Erie, PA
9/01/1979 - 8/17/1992	Weekend Asst., St. George, Erie, PA
9/01/1979 - 8/17/1992	Higher Education, Gannon University, Erie PA
8/17/1992 - 9/05/1997	Pastor, St Paul, Erie, PA
9/05/1997 - 8/10/2012	Pastor, St. Luke's, Erie, PA
9/01/2009 - 8/10/2014	Diocesan Presbyterian Council, Erie, PA
8/10/2012	Retired, Private residence
10/14/2013 - 10/13/2018	Other. Sr. Priest Advocate
9/12/2014 - 9/11/2019	Diocesan Board. Presbyterian Council, Erie, PA

## Summary

Sometime in 1996, a young fifth grade girl came to talk with Sister Steff at St. Boniface school. The child was a student of Steff's. Steff also served as the principal at the school. The girl approached her with her friends because she had disturbing news to report. The young girl told Steff that her godfather, Monsignor Thomas Snyderwine, had taken a shower with her and touched her in ways that she was uncomfortable with. The child reported that this incident occurred five years prior when she stayed overnight at Snyderwine's trailer. The girl added that Snyderwine would buy her dresses and shower her with gifts.

Steff took the girl's information and approached Snyderwine and the girl's parents with the accusation. The parents confirmed the incident and told Steff that they had become friends with Snyderwine, but felt awkward talking to him about the incident. The parents explained that they had informed their daughter to never be alone with him and expressed their gratitude to Steff if she would talk with Snyderwine for them.

When Steff approached Snyderwine with the accusation, she informed him of the incident and threatened to go to Bishop Murphy if this behavior ever happened again. She further admonished Snyderwine by telling him that he had better change his behavior.

## Summary

This incident resurfaced in 2002 because of the increased scrutiny being cast upon the Catholic church in the United States. On May 2, 2002, Steff wrote Bishop Trautman to inform him of the incident that happened six years earlier. Steff wrote that she notified Trautman because of an article she had read in Time Magazine titled, "*What the Nuns Didn't Know.*" Steff also asked Trautman several questions in this letter. She asked Trautman, "*Is showering with a young non relative (in this case, a young girl) an act of Pedophile? I'm not sure. Is it normal Action? I don't think so.*" This letter and Trautman's handwritten notes were discovered in subpoenaed Diocesan files. In his notes, Trautman wrote that he would speak to the Diocesan Review Board on the issue and make a decision on Snyderwine's future in ministry. The only issue was that Steff refused to give the Bishop and the Review Board the name of the family or the victim. Trautman noted that Steff told him, "*she would have to pray and think about that and that she would give me (Trautman) the name only after she spoke with them (victim's parents).*"

In later notes written by Trautman, he documented that the victim was now a freshman in college and the parents (both teachers themselves) did not want to pursue the matter. He also noted that Steff informed him that Snyderwine recently said mass for the family when a death in the family occurred.

Several additional points of interest were found in subpoenaed files, which included Snyderwine's personnel file. A handwritten note by Trautman indicated the following: "*I contacted [the Diocesan lawyer] who said I am not a mandated reporter in this case.*" These documents also contained notes that Trautman took while he was talking with Steff. In one such note, Trautman wrote, "*Sister feels the matter is over with and priest deserves a second chance.*"

## Seminarian John Tome

### Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1949
YEAR OF DEATH:	
ORDINATION:	Failed out of seminary

### Employment/Assignment History

9/03/1963 – 5/31/1967	St. Marks's Seminary High School, Erie PA
Unknown-5/14/1974	St. Mark's Major Seminary, Erie, PA

### Summary

Very little is known about Seminarian John Tome. The subpoenaed Diocesan records contained only four documents. These documents include three documents that state his grades from high school and one letter from Rev. Salvatore Luzzi to Rev. Alban Maguire, Rector of Christ the King Seminary in St. Bonaventure, New York. Salvatore Luzzi is an accused sex offender in the Diocese of Erie (see Luzzi Narrative). This letter shed little light onto Tome's past, it only expressed that Tome had problems communicating with others while in seminary in 1974.

This investigation was able to locate several survivors of Tome's abuse. The Grand Jury heard testimony from and about five members of the same family that Tome had abused in the 1970s. The survivors reported that they were poor, dysfunctional, and dependent upon the diocese for their mother's employment at St. Brigid parish. Furthermore, the parents were befriended by the abusers and the family would often invite them over to engage in drinking parties. Each of the victims testified to the Grand Jury about similar statements that their abuser made to threaten them if they ever disclosed the abuse.

Victim #1 was a twelve year old girl living in the Meadville area who was abused in her home in the mid-1970s. She testified that Tome fondled her on one occasion and that Tome represented to her family that he was a Deacon in the Diocese of Erie at the time of the abuse. She recalled him wearing all black and displaying the trademark white collar that clergy wore. She reported that Tome, whom she knew as "Jack Tome" and Father Stephen Jeselnick would come to her home and drink with her parents until late at night. Stephen Jeselnick is an accused sex offender in the Diocese of Erie (See Jeselnick Narrative). She further testified that her mother worked for the Diocese, specifically, Monsignor Karg, during this time period. This victim testified that on one occasion after a night of drinking with her parents, her mother let Tome put her to bed after she had her night time bath. She testified that as she lay on her stomach in the top bed of a bunk bed, Tome placed his hand under her night gown, then under her panties to her buttocks. She told the Jurists that she was frozen with fear as he rubbed and squeezed her bare buttocks.

## Summary

Victim #1 recalled that as Tome was fondling her, she held her arms tight to her body with her hands over her face. She didn't recall when he left the room or how long the assault lasted. She added that her memory was dark, and that she was only able to talk about the assault after Agents from the Attorney General's Office visited her. After some time, Victim #1 gained the courage to tell her mother what had happened. She said that her mother scolded her for trying to ruin Tome's life and reputation. She added that she believes that her mother informed Monsignor Karg of the incident because Tome "*disappeared for a while and then came back.*" It was this chain of events that made Victim #1 believe her mother told Karg, who in turn sent Tome away.

Much of Victim #1's testimony came in the form a written document that she prepared for the Grand Jury. She explained that reading the details even after so much time would still be difficult for her. Part of her letter read, "*The sexual and emotional torture I built in my head, one man, a man of God, had done so much harm that I was not prepared to face the realities or the gravity of the situation.*" She also wrote, "*This man corrupted my deepest belief system and tarnished my faith and modeled by distrust for others and made it difficult to develop meaningful or trusted relationships. I also developed poor self-image and low self-esteem, identity confusion, sexual confusion, early onset of depression, becoming a defiant teenager, suffering a strong sense of guilt and shame over the experience, and obsessive rumination over the abuse and recurring flashbacks.*"

Victim #2, the younger brother of Victim #1, was approximately eight or nine years old at the time of his abuse at the hands of the man he knew as Deacon Tome. He explained that at his age he did not know the difference between a Deacon and a Priest, however, he often saw Tome wearing vestments. Victim #2 testified that he never told anyone of the abuse for over 40 years. He testified that the abuse began in approximately 1974 and lasted for about a year and a half, occurring as often as once a week. He explained that it consisted of mostly oral sex. The act was performed on him and he was forced to perform the same on Tome. He was emotional as he testified, recalling his sexual abuse and remembering that he saw Tome naked, adding that Tome would often fondle him in front of his parents while they were all in the car together.

Victim #2 testified that he believes that Monsignor Karg knew full well of Tome's behavior, since he would often come over to the family home with Tome and drink with his parents. Victim #2 testified that once he would fall asleep, Tome would find him and sexually abuse him. He expressed anger and frustration that Karg did nothing about Tome's behavior. Victim #2 went on to testify that he feared his little brother also becoming a victim of Tome so he took the abuse, hoping that Tome would not turn his attention to the younger brother.

Victims #3 and #4 are the younger sisters of Victim #1 and asked that their testimony be read into the Grand Jury by an Agent of the Attorney General's Office. In an interview with them about their abuse at the hands of Deacon Tome, they expressed the belief that it would be too emotionally traumatic for them to tell their story in person to a large crowd. They indicated that their interview with the Agents would be the last time they ever wanted to speak of either their abuse or Deacon Tome.

## Summary

Their abuse occurred separately after they went to bed and after Tome was done drinking with their parents, who they described as “*drunks.*” They were very emotional in telling their story, often pausing to regain their composure. Each family member reported that they worked very hard for several years to try to forget about the abuse. Some of the few details they did recall was that it occurred between 1973 and 1979, however they could not recall their exact ages.

Victim #3 said she was abused at least ten times and her sister, Victim #4, stated that she was abused less than ten times but more than five times. A few of the lingering details that they recalled were that Tome would often have a red hat on and that the abuse often involved a pool cue stick. Victim #3 reported that Tome would often attempt to penetrate her with the pool cue and that when she would cry out he would use his fingers to digitally penetrate her. Her sister, Victim #4 said that she did recall the pool cue but had blocked from her memory how Tome had used it on her. She did recall that he used his hands to abuse her.

All three of the sisters recalled how Tome would come to their house to drink and would often play hide and seek or tag with them. Victim #1 told the Agents that Tome would put his hands all over her and her sisters while playing these games. She said she didn’t think much of it when she was younger, however, after the abuse and getting older, she now sees that this horseplay was Tome’s way of groping the sisters.

Finally, the Grand Jury heard from Victim #5, who was between the ages of 10 to 13 years old when he was abused by both Tome and Jeselnick. He testified that Tome and Jeselnick would both engage him in oral sex and anally rape him. Victim #5 indicted that Tome’s abuse occurred at his home and that Jeselnick sexually abused him in the rectory of St. Brigid. He informed the Agents in his interview that he was abused ten to fifteen times, off and on with no regularity. He added that he is currently in therapy that is being paid for privately and that no assistance has been offered by the Diocese to date. This victim also testified that he observed both men naked and that he witnessed them sexually assaulting his sister, Victim #3, as well as his oldest sister, who is now deceased. It was the opinion of Victim #1 and her brother, who was not abused because he was in the military during this time frame, that the oldest and now deceased sister was also victimized by Tome and/or Jeselnick when she was a young girl. It is their belief that she was abused more than any of the other family members.

# Father Patrick Vallimont

## Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	1948
YEAR OF DEATH:	
ORDINATION:	May 17, 1974

## Employment/Assignment History

## Summary

On September 23, 1976, Father Patrick Vallimont was admitted to St. Vincent Health Center, suffering from severe depression. In a letter to the Vatican dated July 7, 1977, Vallimont requested laicization. He disclosed in that document that he had serious doubts about living a life of celibacy. His file noted that he had short sexual relationship with a 13-year-old female parishioner. The Grand Jury found little to no documentation of this relationship in the subpoenaed files received from the Diocese.

Vallimont ended the relationship with the 13-year-old victim when he was released from St. Vincent Health Center.

There were no documents found in the file that indicate that the case was ever turned over to law enforcement.



## Summary

present.... [REDACTED] *denies all sex contact.... [REDACTED] met the victim in [REDACTED] – the victim was 20 yrs... [REDACTED] offers [REDACTED]; case settled for [REDACTED] paid by [REDACTED]. Release given. Pure extortion!*” The note further states that [REDACTED] admitted he attended a gay wedding with another priest, [REDACTED], but did not bless it or offer a prayer and wore a sport jacket during it. The note ended with the following, *“Our investigation shows no truth to any of allegations. [REDACTED] is guilty of going to a gay wedding. No proof of any other charge. Settlement was done to protect [REDACTED] from publicity of wedding.”*

The Grand Jury found handwritten notes by [REDACTED] that also make references to [REDACTED] preference for young boys and a complaint about his unwanted touching. Furthermore, an undated letter from the [REDACTED] appeared to contain some type of warning to [REDACTED] about his handling of [REDACTED]. This warning referred to the friendship between [REDACTED] [REDACTED] because of his sexual abuse of a 16-year-old boy. This victim would eventually settle with [REDACTED] [REDACTED] out of court for [REDACTED].

Two noteworthy undated documents were included in [REDACTED] file. Their approximate timing appeared consistent with the Diocese first having been made aware of the complaint against [REDACTED] in [REDACTED]. An undated, handwritten note titled “[REDACTED]” stated, among other things, that *“3 yrs ago [name] brought suit against [REDACTED] – settled out of court...”* It should be noted that according to media reports, [REDACTED] [REDACTED] was dismissed from the clerical state in 2005 for the sexual abuse of children. The second document was an undated letter sent from [REDACTED] [REDACTED], to [REDACTED] and was located in the files on [REDACTED]. It was a clear reference to the connection between [REDACTED] [REDACTED] stating, *“Dear Bishop, I understand what you are going through. The man here was guilty but we went through much denial. He is still totally unrealistic about his status. Just Bishop be very careful because there are connections...maybe they go back over the years but they come home to haunt us.”*

The Diocese of [REDACTED] continued to assign [REDACTED] to positions where children were abundant. These assignments included weekend duties at [REDACTED], as well as renewing his assignment as [REDACTED] [REDACTED].

The Grand Jury also found a handwritten note by [REDACTED], dated [REDACTED], stating, among other things, that he *“met with [REDACTED] on [REDACTED] about allegations, which [REDACTED] denied. Allegations consisted of a young man now at [REDACTED] being uncomfortable with touch and rubbing of shoulders. This young man refused to see [REDACTED]. Therefore no formal complaint received. Allegations come from his mother (name listed). I admonished [REDACTED] with regard to demonstrative exhibitions of friendship. He simply responded he is part [REDACTED].”*

## Summary

These reports of suspicious rumors and sexual touching by [REDACTED] continued on into [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]. This review of Diocesan documents found another handwritten note by [REDACTED] [REDACTED] dated 2008 documenting some type of meeting or report issued about [REDACTED]. The note stated, among other things, that “*in the past young men complained about [REDACTED] favoring young boys.*” On [REDACTED] an e-mail was sent from the Principal of [REDACTED] [REDACTED], advising that they have called the Childline number to report possible sexual abuse by [REDACTED]. Childline is a state run child advocacy program run by the Pennsylvania Department of Human Services. Their website states “*Childline is part of a mandated statewide child protective services program designed to accept child abuse referrals and general child well-being concerns, and transmit the information quickly to the appropriate investigating agency.*” Attached to the e-mail was a copy of a comment made on what appeared to be a rating site for the [REDACTED]. The comment, referring to “[REDACTED] [REDACTED]” stated, “*He sexually abused my son.*” No further details were found in the records other than a handwritten note by [REDACTED] on a printout of the e-mail advising that they have met with [REDACTED] and he denied the allegation. It is unknown whether this complaint has been verified, although it does appear the Diocese reported it to law enforcement upon learning of it.